Biblical story-telling, Christian art, recitation, and internalization seek direct contact with the Word of God. Jerome reports that in the third century many lay-persons knew " major portions of scripture by heart " (124). Records of the earliest monks tell of explicit exercises to " breathe the scriptures " (130), to internalize so as to live the Word. Meditation and memorization are oral; some monks even speak of " eating the Word of God."

As time marched on, Martin Luther sought to open to the Word of God more faithfully. A Christian goal became not only to hear externally with one's ears but far more importantly to experience " the internal work of the Holy Spirit within the human heart " (150). A typical Christian synthesis assumes the " interpenetration of the oral and the written " (153) will find verification or " echoes " within the human heart. Yet this Christian inner quest seems one step removed from the direct oral and aural *Qur'an* and *Vedas* experienced by Muslims and Hindus.

At this point, Graham steps back to draw some challenging conclusions. #1. From the broader perspective of world scriptural traditions, recent Western emphasis on objectified Biblical textual study seems a historical anomaly, even an aberration which moves away from the far more common effort of traditions to perserve the *total* visual, auditory, tactile, and olfactory experience of the Word. From this perspective, Westerners may even be accused of a deadening imprisonment of the Word in the Book (Bibliolatry—157). #2. If this charge rings even partially true, major efforts must be made to recapture what Graham terms the " sensual dimension of religion " (162). To recapture this oral dimension is to make more vivid the intense personal *engagement* of a community with its sacred text; such a " synaesthetic experience of communal worship " (163) challenges our sensual as well as intellectual spheres of consciousness.

Beyond the Written Word is far more than a teacher's pointer drawing attention to the oral and aural dimensions of the " holy books." It is rather a catalyst, an explicit invitation to probe this fertile field of " orality " ever more fully. More than 65 pages of excellent notes and 40 pages of focused bibliography are suggested as guides for such further search. While I looked in vain for a thorough discussion of the key Biblical questions of " inspiration " and " revelation " in Graham's work, excellent sources on these topics are identified in the notes and bibliography. *Beyond the Written Word* then is a stimulating catalyst; it invites to serious study of the multiple facets of oral tradition.

Frank R. Podgorski
Seton Hall University
South Orange, N. J.

LYLE, EMILY, editor. *Duality.* Cosmos, The Yearbook of the Traditional Cosmology Society, Volume 1, 1985. Edinburgh: Traditional Cosmology Society, 1986. 100 pages. Paper, no price. ISBN 1-869960-009; ISSN 0269-8773.

This slim volume is a concatenation of six papers written by persons with backgrounds as various as English literature, geography, (comparative) religious studies, Scottish studies and anthropology, focussing on various aspects of dual organization. Lacking an introductory statement by the editor, only the title of the book, *Duality*, indicates the unifying theme behind these rather different efforts. Such an introductory state-

ment, pointing out the main themes of the book might have aided the readers in gaining an initial perspective on the problems addressed here.

The most general paper is the fourth one by Frank Whaling who covers Yin Yang, Zoroastrian dualism and Gnosticism. Starting with the Vedanta, he discusses three forms of dualism. First an essentially natural, complementary form of black and white, male and female, yin and yang, in which the interplay between these two factors both defines the universe and the simultaneously unitary and dual totality. Second, there is Zoroastrianism, typified by a cosmic struggle or cosmic dualism in which God and the devil, good and evil twins, heaven and hell are opposed and in which moral choices must be made between these opposites by the participants in the universe. Lastly, he mentions a gnostic dualism of spirit and matter, a transcendant God totally removed from the world, in which the ultimate goal of spirit is to leave the confines of the material world.

The differences between these three types, he concludes, are matters of emphasis, as is the focus on dualism itself. He points at other modes of organization, such as triads, and it is indeed surprising how often the notion of threes surfaces in this book dedicated to twos.

The first paper, by Emily Lyle, deals with hostile twins. As she discusses them, they seem to fit into the previously mentioned category of cosmic struggle and indeed she briefly refers to the Iranian tradition. The reason for the struggle between the twins, as elucidated by Lyle, is primogeniture and the question of who will have the right to rule since as twins both can claim the kingship. In the end they are given dominion over different spheres. Lyle then goes on to look at the position of these twin rulers in various theogonies, arriving at a general grouping of two sets of five, each ruled by one of the twins; a king of the realm of darkness and death and a king of life and light, recalling the original duality.

The following paper by Andrew Duff-Cooper examines duality in various aspects of Balinese life on the island of Lombok. Beginning with a very lucid explication of Balinese cosmological principles, he points out that the animating power of the Balinese cosmos is perfectly bilaterally symmetrical. This force is further simultaneously unitary and dual and thus seems to relate to Whaling's first category. However, in Balinese thought, Duff-Cooper writes, such perfect symmetry is possible only between empty categories and in daily life various degrees of asymmetry are allowed, within the limits demanded by the situation. He then traces the ramifications of this not quite symmetrical dual unity through various aspects of Balinese life such as temples, social groupings, personhood, and aesthetics in which it becomes clear that duality and symmetry are both relative to the context in which they occur. At one point he emphasizes that in Balinese culture the distinction between sacred and profane is perhaps not as relevant as elsewhere since most activities are seen to fall within the sacred sphere. He thus distinguishes between the material and non-material participants in these processes who together form both a unity and an asymmetric duality.

A paper by Thomas McElwain, seeking to associate soul dualism with Adena burials, and one by Robert A. Dodgshon that attempts to link a method of classifying various social divisions of the landscape with a possible dual orientation in medieval Celtic society, both suffer from a lack of actual ethnographic data as a context in which these problems can be analysed. Where in the previous papers the authors had either local informants or could choose from copious literatures that directly bear on their problem, McElwain has reference only to some general Indian notions of the soul and can in the end only speculate on their relationship to burial mounds.

Dodgshon's material seems to have such a background available to it but this is

not presented in such a way as to convince this reader. He frequently refers to dual organization in " primitive " societies and to the possibility of such an organization having existed among the medieval Celts, but does not clearly demonstrate this. A greater relience on the literature analysing European mythology and social organization might have been helpful here.

About Elizabeth Porges Watson's paper on duality in Spencer's Faerie Queene I can, as an anthropologist, say little. Yet one observation she makes strikes me as nearly metaphoric for the problem posed by this volume. She writes of the potential relations between the poet, the reader and the poem, and through various reflections on mirrors she finally finds the reader and the poet face to face, both inhabiting both the real world and that of the poem.

If for poem we substitute here " symbolic construction," we are suddenly faced with a problem only indirectly addressed by these authors, namely to what degree these questions of duality are a matter of symbolic interpretation, both by the participants and by the scholar. Duff-Cooper emphasizes the social facts which comprise his data, but does not acknowledge that the selection of such facts is highly dependent on the researcher. Whaling seems to realize these questions when he asks what dualism should relate to and points out that dualism is a model among other models, but he mentions these things only in passing. A further discussion of these matters might have been appropriate in an introductory statement.

As a model then, dualism is a symbolic construction, either by the actors, the observers or both, and as a symbolic construction it is subject to the same interpretational problems as other symbols, namely that a geat deal if not all of the meaning of such constructions is not inherrent in the symbolic object, but is brought to it by the observer. In Watson's symbolic mirror therefor we can try to find the poet but in the end we will most probably see ourselves.

Robert Wessing
Katholieke Universiteit
Nijmegen, The Netherlands

LYLE, EMILY, editor. *Kingship*. Cosmos, The Yearbook of the Traditional Cosmology Society, Volume 2, 1986. Edinburgh: Traditional Cosmology Society, 1988. 183 pages. Paper. ISBN 1-869960-01-7; ISSN 0269-8773.

In the first of nine wide-ranging essays on kingship, Hillenbrand examines the uses, both secular and sacral, of the rayed nimbus, a predominantly Christian symbol, in early Islamic art. In rich detail, his essay describes the syncretistic borrowing and subsequent indigenous improvisations of the rayed nimbus in a variety of media and places from Umayyad Syria (the Khirbat al Mafjar), Abbasid Iraq (the plan of the city of Baghdad), Aghlabid Iffriqiyya (the Great Mosques of Tunis and Qairawan), Umayyad Spain (the Great Mosque of Cordoba), Fatmid and Makluk Egypt (the façade of the Amar Mosque and other *mihrabs* as well as metal work objects) to Ilkhanid Iran (an illustration in Rashid al-Din's *Jamail-Tawarikh*). In Wright's article, again dealing with iconography, the emphasis is on the doctrinal and technical aspects (in particular, the rediscovery of perspective) that modify the iconography of the Coronation of the Virgin. This shift, essentially from a theophanic to symbolic mode, is traced from the narrative-oriented portrayals of the Virgin's identification with the