

R. KELLER KIMBROUGH  
*University of Colorado,  
Boulder*

## Preaching the Animal Realm in Late Medieval Japan

### Abstract

Seventeenth- and eighteenth-century Japanese visual and textual sources are replete with images and descriptions of *Kumano bikuni*, the itinerant and seemingly ubiquitous proselytizer-nuns known for preaching upon elaborate paintings of heavens and hells at crossroads, bridges, and other public spaces in early Edo-period Japan. Although the women's painted props survive, their stories do not. In this article, I seek to explore the likely contents of *Kumano bikuni's* preaching upon (non-human) animals and the animal realm by examining seemingly related stories employed in a variety of Japanese proselytizing traditions in the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries, including didactic accounts preserved in sutra commentaries, works of popular Buddhist fiction, and one "official" temple history. By extrapolating tales and ideas from these near-contemporaneous textual sources, I attempt to reconstruct some broad aspects of the lost sermon-stories of *Kumano bikuni*, as well as to illuminate some traditional (late medieval) Japanese beliefs concerning animals and human-animal relations.

**Keywords:** *Kumano bikuni*—*Kumano kanjin jikkai mandara*—*otogizōshi*—medieval Japanese Buddhist fiction—animals—animal realm

**A**MONG the most striking artifacts of seventeenth- and eighteenth-century Japanese religious culture is a group of paintings of the ten worlds of enlightened and non-enlightened existence known as *Kumano kanjin jikkai mandara* 熊野観心十界曼荼羅, or Kumano Mind Contemplation Ten Worlds Mandala (hereafter Kumano Mandala). Dominated by ghastly images of the tortures of hell, the paintings are large, colorful, and vividly gruesome tableaux: they measure some 130 by 140 centimeters, are painted on paper (rather than silk) with a coarse and inexpensive pigment known as *doro enogu* 泥絵具, and were employed as props in more than a century of picture-based preaching and storytelling by itinerant female proselytizers (*Kumano bikuni* 熊野比丘尼, or “Kumano nuns”) who were loosely affiliated with the three-site Kumano shrine complex on the remote Kii Peninsula in central Japan. Approximately fifty Kumano Mandala are known to survive today; of these, at least thirty-three show the wear and tear associated with repeated folding, indicating their use in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries by the mendicant, fund-raising *Kumano bikuni*, who would unfurl them at festivals, bridges, temples and shrines, and use them as a basis to preach.<sup>1</sup>

As their name suggests, Kumano Mind Contemplation Ten Worlds Mandala depict the ten worlds of enlightened and non-enlightened existence, comprised of the six realms of heaven, humans, *ashura* 阿修羅 (a world of never-ending battle), animals, hungry ghosts, and hell, and the four sacred worlds (*shishōkai* 四聖界) of buddhas, bodhisattvas, *srāvakas*, and *pratyekabuddhas*.<sup>2</sup> Although none are identical, all Kumano Mandala of the “standard” (*teikei* 定型) variety are more-or-less the same.<sup>3</sup> A typical example from the Hyōgo Prefectural Museum of History (FIGURE 1) depicts in its upper part the so-called “hill of age” (*oi no saka* 老いの坂), which illustrates the temporal course of human life, beginning with a baby on the right and ending with old age and death on the left. Immediately beneath the apex of the hill is the world of buddhas, represented by Amida in the center. Below this is the ideograph for *kokoro* 心, or “heart-mind.” Thin red lines connect the *kokoro* to each of the ten worlds, suggesting the Kegon Buddhist concept of “heart-mind only” (*yuishin* 唯心), according to

which all of the ten worlds are emanations of the human heart-mind.<sup>4</sup> Each of the six realms is marked by a red *torii* 鳥居 gate: the realm of heaven is depicted to the left of the *kokoro*; the human realm to the right; the realm of hungry ghosts to the lower left; the *ashura* realm to the lower right; the animal realm to the lower-lower right; and the hell realm, which is the most expansively illustrated, directly below.<sup>5</sup>

The animal realm contains two hybrid beasts—a horse and an ox, both of which are painted with human heads—as well as an assortment of other non-human creatures. In the case of the Hyōgo Kumano Mandala, these are a goat, a snake, a dog, a stag, and a rooster (FIGURE 2).<sup>6</sup> Other Kumano Mandala include foxes, crows, and clams as well. In most Kumano Mandala of the standard type, the animal realm is depicted directly above the “two-wives hell” (*futame jigoku* 兩婦地獄), represented by a man entwined by two snakes with women’s heads (the man’s former wives, whose jealousy has transformed them into reptilian hybrids), and to the upper left of the “sword-leaf hell” (*tōyōrin jigoku* 刀葉林地獄), which shows a man driven by lust to climb up and down a sword-studded tree in pursuit of an attractive woman. The “blood-pool hell” (*chi no ike jigoku* 血の池地獄) is painted in the lower right-hand corner of the tableau, and although it, too, contains several hybrid snake-women, medieval Japanese textual sources tend to classify it and the two-wives hell as features of the hell realm, rather than the realm of beasts.<sup>7</sup> Such distinctions can be misleading, however, considering that according to the Tendai Buddhist concept of universal mutual interpenetration (*jikkai gogu* 十界互具, the “mutual containment of the ten worlds”), the realms of hell and animals are understood to contain one within the other, separate yet the same. Kuroda Hideo has written that the depiction of the animal realm in Kumano Mandala is “totally unlike” its representations in earlier images of the six realms, and that it therefore appears to be a product of the late medieval period alone (ca. sixteenth century).<sup>8</sup>

Despite the large number of extant Kumano Mandala, scholars have little knowledge of the tone, emphases, or precise contents of *Kumano bikuni*’s sermons, particularly in regard to such simply illustrated scenes as the heavenly and animal realms. Other than the paintings, there are few surviving records, and since the *bikuni* themselves had largely disappeared by the close of the eighteenth century, their oral transmissions have all been lost. One contemporaneous clue is contained in the puppet play *Shume no hōgan Morihisa* 主馬判官盛久 (“The Stablemaster Police Lieutenant Morihisa”), composed in 1686 by Chikamatsu Monzaemon 近松門左衛門. In the fourth act, the female characters Hōshōgaku and Kiku no Mae pretend to be *Kumano bikuni* so that they may be allowed to pass through a highway checkpoint without an appropriate permit. The guards are suspicious, and they order the women to perform a sermon upon a painting that they carry—an apparent Kumano Mandala.<sup>9</sup> Hōshōgaku does as

she is told, and in the course of her preaching, she declares that the punishment for “a woman who seduces a priest, or a man who violates a nun,” is to be reborn as an “ignorant horse” or a “stupid ox.”<sup>10</sup>

Chikamatsu’s description of Hōshōgaku’s performance is terse, and some 320 years later, the reader is left to wonder: does it accurately portray a contemporary *Kumano bikuni*’s sermon? Did *Kumano bikuni* commonly employ the specter of the animal realm in order to warn against sexual impropriety with monastics, or was the fictional Hōshōgaku responding to a perceived threat of sexual assault? Or was it Chikamatsu’s intention, in depicting a clever imposter, to be haphazard, parodic, or even droll? While there are no obvious answers to these questions, they can be addressed by exploring some of the late medieval Tendai, Pure Land, and popular Buddhist proselytizing traditions concerning animals and the animal realm as they are preserved in roughly contemporaneous fictional and doctrinal textual sources. By doing so, we may shed light on the nature of *Kumano bikuni*’s explanations of the animal realm, as well as on some of the late medieval Japanese Buddhist conceptions of, and attitudes toward, animals and the animal realm in general.

#### TRAVELERS’ TALES

In the history of Japanese six realms thought, the Tendai priest Genshin’s 源信 *Ōjō yōshū* 往生要集 (“Essentials for Pure Land Salvation,” 985) was a work of major influence among medieval Buddhist scholars. In his discussion of the animal realm, Genshin explains that non-human animals (*chikushō* 畜生) number some 3,400,000,000 types of creatures, comprising the three categories of birds, beasts, and insects (the latter of which also includes worms). Genshin explains that while the animal realm is principally located in the “great sea” (*taikai* 大海), it contains lesser branches within the human and heavenly realms, and that it is a place of constant and terrible suffering due to animals’ propensity to attack and eat each other, as well as to their liability to be hunted, enslaved, and abused by men. Genshin writes that animal-realm rebirth is the punishment for “the stupid and the shameless (*guchi* 愚痴, *muzan* 無慚), and for those who uselessly receive alms from the faithful without repaying their generosity in kind.”<sup>11</sup> In his *Kanjin ryakuyōshū* 観心略要集 (“Brief essentials of contemplation”; 1017), Genshin similarly states that rebirth in the animal realm is for “the stupid and the ignorant” (*guchi* 愚痴, *muchi* 無智).<sup>12</sup>

Although *Ōjō yōshū* was an important treatise for medieval scholar-priests, its influence upon *Kumano bikuni* and other “popular” (non-scholastic and non-elite) proselytizers was apparently less direct. There are in fact far more promising sources for extrapolating the likely sermons of *Kumano bikuni* in the seventeenth century, including a group of medieval fictional narratives

(*otogizōshi* お伽草子) that purport to describe various human travelers' fantastic journeys through the six realms and back. These “hell-tour tales” (*jigoku henreki dan* 地獄遍歴譚), as they are sometimes called, include five or six works of popular fiction from the fifteenth, sixteenth, and early seventeenth centuries with obvious roots in medieval Buddhist proselytizing traditions (although not those of *Kumano bikuni*).<sup>13</sup> Like their more famous painted counterparts—the Kumano Mind Contemplation Ten Worlds Mandala—these narratives tend to be dominated by their horrific representations of the tortures of hell. They devote considerably less attention to the other five realms of heaven, humans, animals, *ashura*, and hungry ghosts, suggesting that their authors and reciters, like *Kumano bikuni*, were most inclined to preach upon hell.



FIGURE 1: The Hyōgo *Kumano Mind Contemplation Ten Worlds Mandala* (seventeenth century). Courtesy of Ogurisu Kenji and the Hyōgo Prefectural Museum of History.



FIGURE 2: The Animal Realm (*chikushōdō* 畜生道). From the Hyōgo *Kumano Mind Contemplation Ten Worlds Mandala* (seventeenth century). Courtesy of Ogurisu Kenji and the Hyōgo Prefectural Museum of History.



FIGURE 3: The Animal Realm (*chikushōdō*). From the Formanek *Kumano Mind Contemplation Ten Worlds Mandala* (seventeenth century). Private collection, Vienna. Courtesy of Susanne Formanek.





FIGURE 4: A horse-headed demon (*mezu* 馬頭) pulling a sinner in a burning cart. From the Hyōgo *Kumano Mind Contemplation Ten Worlds Mandala* (seventeenth century). Courtesy of Ogurisu Kenji and the Hyōgo Prefectural Museum of History.



FIGURE 5: A bestial demon torturing a sinner in hell. From the Formanek *Kumano Mind Contemplation Ten Worlds Mandala* (seventeenth century). Private collection, Vienna. Courtesy of Susanne Formanek.



FIGURE 6: Illustration from *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* (late seventeenth century *nara ehon*), Spencer Collection, The New York Public Library, Astor, Lenox and Tilden Foundations. I am grateful to Hank Glassman for bringing this image to my attention.



FIGURE 7: A mother and her child beside the animal realm. From the Formanek *Kumano Mind Contemplation Ten Worlds Mandala* (seventeenth century). Private collection, Vienna. Courtesy of Susanne Formanek.



Possibly the most widely-reproduced late medieval hell-tour tale is *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* (The Tale of the Fuji Cave), which tells of the Kamakura-period warrior Nitta no Shirō Tadatsune's exploration of a mysterious cavern on the side of Mount Fuji. In the depths of the cave, Nitta encounters the Great Asama Bodhisattva, the resident guardian-deity of the mountain, and in exchange for Nitta's swords, the Bodhisattva leads Nitta on a mostly terrifying tour of the six realms and the Pure Land. At the end of their journey, the Bodhisattva presents Nitta with a set of three "golden scrolls" containing painted images of what they have seen, and he instructs him to use them to preach. In a *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* manuscript dated the fourth month of Keichō 慶長 12 (1607), the Bodhisattva explains that "most people are unimpressed by hell because they can't see it with their own eyes. You should show these scrolls to them."<sup>14</sup>

On the basis of this and other internal evidence, Nishino Toshiko has argued that the *Fuji* story was recited in the Muromachi period by a combination of *etoki bikuni* 絵解比丘尼 (picture-explaining nuns), who may have entertained audiences by confessing to their own lurid sins in the course of reciting the *Fuji* tale, and *zatō* 座頭 (blind minstrel priests), who are specifically praised within the work, and who may have been married to *etoki bikuni*.<sup>15</sup> Nishino's proposition is intriguing, but insofar as the hell scenes described in *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* are inconsistent with those depicted in extant Kumano Mandala, the *etoki bikuni* of her theory are unlikely to have been *Kumano bikuni*. Koyama Issei has more recently (and more persuasively) argued that the *Fuji* story was recited by medieval *yamabushi* 山伏 mountain ascetics and, possibly, mendicant *miko* 巫女 (shamanesses, or shrine maidens) from the Fuji mountain region.<sup>16</sup> Whatever the case may have been, each of the earliest surviving *Fuji* texts—six manuscripts that pre-date the widely reproduced 1627 woodblock-printed edition—is unique in its phrasing and in its organization of tortures along Nitta's tour, indicating the story's probable roots in an oral Buddhist narrative tradition.<sup>17</sup> Judging from the account of the Great Asama Bodhisattva's gift of "golden scrolls," which serves as an apparent explanation for the origins of medieval *Fuji no hitoana sōshi*-related preaching, the story was probably transmitted, like the contemporaneous tales of *Kumano bikuni*, with the aid of painted props.

A second medieval hell-tour narrative to consider in conjunction with *Kumano bikuni*'s preaching upon the animal realm is *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi* ("Back from the dead at Chōhōji Temple"), written by an unknown author at some time between 1439 and 1513. Surviving in two unillustrated manuscripts dated Eishō 永正 10 (1513) and Eiroku 永禄 4 (1561), *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi* is the purportedly autobiographical account of the nun Keishin's journey in the sixth month of 1439 from Chōhōji in the Hirano district of Osaka to the court of King Enma 閻魔王, the judge and ruler of the afterworld. A combination of internal and external evidence strongly suggests that Keishin's story was

employed in Chōhōji temple-based preaching in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries,<sup>18</sup> the principal intent of which seems to have been to inspire the commission of *gyakushu* 逆修-type Buddhist memorial rites.<sup>19</sup> Internal allusions to Kumano—to Keishin’s former pilgrimage to Kumano, and to Enma’s interest in her visit there<sup>20</sup>—suggest a connection to the cult of the three Kumano shrines, though perhaps not to the preaching of *Kumano bikuni*.

In *Fuji no hitoana sōshi*, *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi*, and most traditional Japanese painted representations of hell, including Kumano Mandala, the dead are tormented by *gozu* 牛頭 and *mezu* 馬頭, ox- and horse-headed demons, whose physical appearance is the approximate inverse of the human-headed ox and horse depicted in the animal realm in the Kumano Mandala. Although the significance of this is unclear, sinners (*zainin* 罪人) in these and other works of medieval hell-tour fiction are frequently tortured by and in the manner of beasts (or are shown to suffer like beasts) for having eaten, killed, imprisoned, or otherwise abused one or more non-human creatures. In *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi*, for example, Keishin describes “the wailing of the people lamenting their crimes” as being “like the lowing of a thousand oxen all slaughtered at once,” and she witnesses a man being flayed, skewered, and then roasted over a fire—like a fish or a rabbit, perhaps—as his punishment for having fished, hunted, and/or collected eggs.<sup>21</sup> In another place, Keishin watches as a man is stuffed into an iron bird-cage for having kept birds in his former life, and she sees a former falconer being devoured by his falcon and all the animals that he caused to be killed.<sup>22</sup>

In *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi*, Enma invites Keishin on a guided tour of hell. In the course of their peregrination, they encounter a former priest of a non-Pure Land Buddhist sect (a crime in itself, it would seem) who both engaged in farming—an activity prohibited to monastics—and mistreated his horses and oxen. Keishin describes the scene:

Horse- and ox-headed demons were harnessing a man to a large Chinese plow. Fastening ropes all around, they flogged him and shouted, “Pull!” The man tried to do as he was told, but the burden was too heavy and he was unable to take a single step. Enraged, the demons beat him all the more. Streaming blood from his eyes and mouth, he was beside himself with grief. Still, the demons intensified their abuse. The man panted for breath, his eyeballs bulging and his tongue aloll. A swarm of insects feasted on his flesh in a manner that was most difficult to watch. Enma explained: “This man was a priest in a self-practice sect,<sup>23</sup> but rather than performing his ritual duties, he set about farming. He kept horses and oxen and spent day and night indulging his covetous heart. Stupid, stingy, and greedy, he was an enemy of Buddhism. This is the torment for those who ignore others’ pain,

and who use animals unkindly, saying that it's alright because they don't complain. (SNKBZ 63: 430–31)

In *Fuji no hitoana sōshi*, Nitta witnesses a similar punishment near *Shide no yama* 死出の山, the “Mountain of Death.” The Great Asama Bodhisattva provides a related explanation as well, suggesting that such pronouncements against cruelty to farm animals were relatively common in the sermon-stories of late medieval preachers. The narrator of a hand-copied *Fuji* manuscript dated the fifth month of Keichō 8 (1603) explains:

Nitta saw demon wardens flogging a sinner who was burdened with a heavy stone. With cries of, “Climb! Climb!” demons were hounding countless others up the jagged sides of iron boulders. “These are people who overloaded horses in the course of doing business,” the Bodhisattva explained. “They reveled in their profits and callously worked their animals to death. They’ll suffer constantly like this for eighteen thousand years. Nitta, tell everyone in the human world: never overload a horse just because it can’t speak. You’ll go to hell if you do.” (MJMT 11: 437a)

According to two alternate *Fuji* manuscripts from the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries (the hand-copied Keio and 1627 woodblock printed texts), the formerly abused horses and oxen themselves will become demons and torture their former owners in hell.<sup>24</sup>

After passing through the realms of hell and hungry ghosts, Nitta and the Bodhisattva eventually come to the animal realm. The *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* narrator has exceedingly little to say about the bestial plane, indicating its relative unimportance in late medieval *Fuji* preaching, but what he (or she?) does say is intriguing:

Looking into the animal realm, Nitta saw all the birds of the sky and beasts of the earth spliced together in disturbing combinations. [The Bodhisattva spoke:] “This is what happens to children who are overly attached to their parents, and to people who are overly attached to their stepmothers or stepchildren. They all fall into the animal realm.” (MJMT 11: 446a; 1603 *Fuji* text)

Nitta’s view of the hybrid beasts recalls the hybrid animals in the Kumano Mandala, as we can see from an image of two human-headed oxen in a late-seventeenth-century *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* manuscript in the Spencer Collection of the New York Public Library (FIGURE 6). A *kushōjin* 俱生神, or “birth companion deity,”<sup>25</sup> stands in the center of the illustration, and the Jōhari Mirror is visible

to the left, indicating that the scene is set in the court of King Enma, rather than in a place specifically represented as the animal realm, thereby reminding us of the interpenetrating nature of the six realms.

The Bodhisattva's explanation for why people fall into the animal realm—excessive emotional attachment between parents and children (or stepparents and stepchildren)—is wholly unlike Genshin's, but it is supported by Enma's explanation in *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi*, included at the end of Keishin's description of the bustle and chaos surrounding Enma's court:

Some hundred and twenty yards before the Ten Kings was a place like a vast stage upon which as many as a thousand monks, priests, nuns, laywomen, laymen, and children were gathered.<sup>26</sup> To the side were horses, oxen, dogs, and all kinds of beasts, birds, and creatures with wings—everything, that is, into which a human might be born. In fact, of all sentient beings, there are none who do not appear before King Enma's court. There were Buddhas to the east, and to the north there were demons rushing this way and that like a scattering of baby spiders.

The Jōhari Mirror was farther to the north. It was huge like a mountain. For those who face it, all sins and virtues are fully revealed. The people in the stage-like area were first sorted according to Enma's tablets, after which they were forced before the mirror, where nothing is concealed. The demons to the north then set upon the evildoers and tormented them in ways befitting their sins, dragging some off to the realms of hungry ghosts and animals, some to the *ashura* realm of eternal carnage, and others to various hells. "Ah!" the people screamed with unspeakable chagrin, "I wasted my life committing crimes, and planted no good karmic roots!"

Horse- and ox-headed demons pulled a carriage in my direction. It was loaded with twenty people, men and women of both high and low social standing. As I watched, it burst into a raging mass of fire. The bellowing taunts of the ox-headed demons were flaming as well. "This is what's called a 'burning carriage,'" Enma explained. "It carries those who are guilty of the Ten Evils and the Five Heinous Crimes. They're on their way to *Muken jigoku* 無間地獄, the Hell of No Respite.<sup>27</sup> Once they fall in, they're not likely to escape, even if people hold services for them and plant good karmic roots. But they'll get out eventually, after several dozen thousand kalpas."<sup>28</sup>

Enma further explained: "Those blue and red demons binding and herding the evildoers with ropes and wooden neck pillories are on their way to the realms of beasts and hungry ghosts. The neck pillories are for people who died begrudging their lives because of their love for their children. They can attain Buddhahood in thirty-three years, if someone conducts services for them without interruption." (SNKBZ 63: 427–29)

Like the Great Asama Bodhisattva, Enma explains that people may be dropped into the realm of animals (and hungry ghosts) because of their attachment to their own lives as a result of their love for their children.<sup>29</sup> Unrelenting emotional attachment suggests the primal, animalistic side of human nature, which may account for its association with the sub-human planes. While the precise reason for parents' relegation to these particular evil realms is left unexplained in *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* and *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi*, the sentiment behind it is far from new. As the Kamakura-period scholar-priest Mujū Ichien 無住一円 wrote in *Shasekishū* ("A collection of sand and pebbles"; ca. 1280), "misfortune underlies the blessings of a beloved wife and child, piercing a man like a lovely arrow. Although pleasant to look at, [the arrow] will take your life."<sup>30</sup>

In *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi*, Enma's description of the loving parents who are led away in "wooden neck pillories" (*kubikase* 頸枷) is particularly revealing, because the vast majority of extant Kumano Mandala—28 of the 33 mandala in its "standard" form—contain a similar painted scene.<sup>31</sup> In the Formanek Kumano Mandala, for example, a bare-chested woman with a wooden pillory around her neck gazes down at a child with outstretched arms (FIGURE 7). The image is set to the immediate upper-right of the animal realm, toward which the woman's feet are pointed. Kuroda Hideo has identified this depiction of a mother and her child with the aphorism, "the parent-child [relationship] is a neck pillory of the three worlds" (*oyako wa sangai no kubikase* 親子は三界の首枷),<sup>32</sup> and his identification suggests the likely theme of *Kumano bikuni*'s preaching upon the neck-pillory scene. The scene's proximity to the animal realm,<sup>33</sup> together with the relevant passages in *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* and *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi*, further suggests that *Kumano bikuni*'s explanations of the bestial plane concerned the plight of parents who would be reborn there as a result of their love for their children. Ogurisu Kenji has argued that the layout of images in Kumano Mandala evolved in accord with the storytelling needs of *Kumano bikuni*;<sup>34</sup> if this was indeed the case, then the inclusion of the neck-pillory scene in the majority of Kumano Mandala in its later, standardized form would appear to indicate a traditional and powerful connection between the themes of parental attachment and the pains of animal rebirth in the preaching of seveneenth- and eighteenth-century *Kumano bikuni*.

#### BEASTLY MOTHERS AND DUTIFUL DAUGHTERS

While we may posit with relative confidence that *Kumano bikuni* preached upon the dangers of parental attachment in conjunction with their discussions of the animal realm, it is impossible without further textual documentation to ascertain with any specificity what else they may or may not have expounded in connection with those same painted scenes. Considering the oral nature of



Buddhist picture explication, the nuns' sermon-stories inevitably changed over time, and they are likely to have varied to considerable degrees among individual proselytizers as well. Recovering the lost contents of *Kumano bikuni's* preaching upon the animal realm is therefore a quixotic and ultimately hopeless task; the best that we can do is to explore some of the stories that circulated within contemporaneous Buddhist proselytizing traditions about people who were reborn as either a horse or an ox, since those are the two hybrid animals most prominently and consistently depicted in extant Kumano Mandala.

One such story is contained in the priest Eishin's 榮心 Tendai *Lotus Sutra* commentary *Hokekyō jikidanshō* 法華經直談鈔 ("Straight talk on the *Lotus Sutra*;" hereafter *Jikidanshō*), compiled at Sugaoji 菅生寺 in the Sakata 坂田 region of Ōmi 近江 province in the years immediately preceding Eishin's death in 1546. Likely composed as a kind of primer or source book for teaching the *Lotus Sutra* to lay audiences at Tendai instructional centers (*dangisho* 談義所) throughout the countryside,<sup>35</sup> *Jikidanshō* is one of several fifteenth- and sixteenth-century commentaries that seek to explain the *Lotus Sutra* in an unambiguous, straightforward manner, favoring concrete examples from the everyday realms of lay and monastic society over complex or exceedingly abstract doctrinal discussions.<sup>36</sup> As a result, it contains a plethora of tales—approximately 380, by Ikeyama Issaien's count (IKEYAMA 1979, 9)—which allows for a relatively comprehensive investigation of the kinds of parables employed in Tendai preaching in the mid-sixteenth century.

As one might expect, *Jikidanshō* includes a substantial number of stories about animals and the people who become them, suggesting the acuity of Claude Lévi-Strauss's famous dictum that in addition to being good to eat, animals are "good to think" with, too.<sup>37</sup> Many of the animal-accounts in *Jikidanshō* concern upwardly-mobile dogs, bats, and monkeys who are reported to have achieved rebirth in a better place—either the human or heavenly realms—as a result of hearing the *Lotus Sutra* or some alternate explication of the Buddhist Law.<sup>38</sup> Other accounts include those of humans who fell into the realm of beasts (as an insect, a dragon, or a hundred-headed fish) as a result of their attachments to fine tastes and smells, or for having abused a disciple of the Buddha.<sup>39</sup> In the "Myōshōgon'ō honji hon" 妙莊嚴王本事品 chapter of the commentary, in the context of a discussion of *zenchishiki* 善知識 "dharma companions"—those beings or events that sentient beings encounter in the course of their lives that lead them toward the Buddhist path—Eishin cites the following story of a woman in Sui-period China (ca. 581–618) who transmigrated from hell to the animal realm, where she was reborn as a horse:

In the Sui period in ancient China, there was a woman with two children. One was a boy, and the other a girl. The woman died, and her two children

wept with boundless grief. The daughter visited her mother's grave every day, bringing flowers that she had picked, offering water, and reciting the *nenbutsu*. Several years passed in this way.

There happened to be a river along the road to the cemetery, and it rose up one time when there was a great rain. Being a woman, the daughter was unable to cross, so she had her brother ford it instead. The brother rode a horse into the current, and when the horse refused to walk, he lashed it with a rod.

That night the mother spoke to her daughter in a dream: "Because of my deep karmic obstructions, I fell into *Muken jigoku*, the Hell of No Respite, as soon as I died. However, I was able to escape from there as a result of the merit from your devotions, and now I've fallen into the animal realm, where I've been reborn as a horse. Because of my lingering love for my children, I have become your brother's horse. But he beat me severely yesterday, lashing my face and causing me horrible pain. If you doubt this, then take a look at my face tomorrow." The mother wept copious tears, and the daughter awoke.

The daughter went to her brother's residence at dawn. Examining his horse, she saw that its face was indeed swollen. The brother and sister thereupon awakened to a desire for Buddhist truth, and they both took monastic vows. They performed devotions for the sake of their mother's enlightenment, and they and their mother all attained Buddhahood together.<sup>40</sup>

The story is a felicitous one, because it tells of the mysterious manner in which a son and a daughter—a profoundly filial daughter—came to take holy vows and achieve enlightenment in the company of their wayward mother. Attachments are to be shunned in the present life, and the mother's inability to forgo her own maternal affections represents a kind of emotional enslavement to her children: a bondage that is literalized within the story as her actual animal subordination to her son. Whether the daughter's unfailing devotions are inspired by a similar sort of attachment is unclear; in any case, their efficacy is obvious, and the daughter is presented as a model for women in Buddhism.

The mother's explanation of her plight is especially intriguing for what it reveals about contemporary beliefs regarding rebirth in the animal realm. Her claim to have been reborn as her former son's horse because of her unrelenting attachment to him (*ko o omofu aishū* 子ヲ思フ愛執) recalls the explanations in *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* and *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi* that animal-realm rebirth is the punishment for parents and children who die entangled in the fetters of love. It is also seemingly at odds with Eishin's own traditionally "orthodox" pronouncements. In the "Hiyu-bon" 譬喩品 chapter of *Jikidanshō*, for example, Eishin explains that "some animals dwell in the sky, and some mix among men.

Most are reborn as beasts because of their stupidity.”<sup>41</sup> Then, quoting explicitly from Genshin’s *Kanjin ryakuyōshū* of 1017, Eishin writes that the animal realm is a place where “the stupid and the ignorant are reborn.”<sup>42</sup>

According to an alternate version of the *Jikidanshō* story in the early fifteenth-century *Sangoku denki* 三国伝記 (Tales of Three Countries), after discovering that their mother was a horse, the brother and sister fed her succulent grasses and built her a temple pagoda. She is said to have attained rebirth in Tosotsu Heaven 兜率天 as a result.<sup>43</sup> *Jikidanshō* contains no such explanation, and it is therefore unclear what the brother and sister in that story did with their mother once they realized who she was. Although Eishin sidesteps the issue, the question of how to treat our animal relatives (or animals in general, since there is usually no way to tell who was reborn as what) is both practical and profound. The thirteenth-century Mujū Ichien observes that we eat our parents whenever we eat fish or meat (quoting from the *Bonmōkyō* 梵網經 sutra, he explains that all sentient beings have been both our mother and our father in a previous life),<sup>44</sup> but he fails to address the kind of problem faced by the orphaned siblings in the *Jikidanshō* account. The issue is not entirely ignored in late medieval Buddhist sources, however, as we can see from a story about a woman who was reborn as a yellow ox in the six-fascicle *Seiryōji engi* 清涼寺縁起 (“A History of Seiryōji”; ca. 1515), an institutional mytho-history that was likely employed in preaching and temple fund-raising in the early sixteenth century.<sup>45</sup>

The *Seiryōji* history is primarily concerned with relating the legends and oracles of the *Seiryōji* “principal image” (*honzon* 本尊), a sandalwood statue of Shakyamuni Buddha. In its sixth fascicle, *Seiryōji engi* tells of the Imperial Lady Kitashirakawa 北白河女院, who was the mother of a woman by the name of Ankamon’in 安嘉門院 (1209–1283). Having failed to plant good karmic roots in the course of her lifetime, Kitashirakawa is said to have died, ominously, at the height of a raging thunderstorm. Fortunately her daughter, Ankamon’in, was both filial and devout. *Seiryōji engi* explains that after her mother’s death,

Ankamon’in came to spend all of her time performing devotions in the [Seiryōji] Buddha Hall. Because she felt certain that her mother had not been reborn in a good place, she spent seven years performing a variety of memorial services on her behalf. Praying to be informed of the site of her mother’s rebirth, Ankamon’in passed many years traveling to our temple and supplicating the principal image. During one of her periods of devotional confinement she received an oracle in a dream:

“Your mother fell into hell because of her many transgressions, but you have performed various services for her with honest intent, and her punishment has been lightened as a result. She has now left hell and entered the animal realm, where she has been reborn as an ox. If you wish to see her,

look for the seven oxen dragging lumber from the west of the temple early tomorrow morning. Your mother will be the fourth from the front—the yellow one, that is.”

Ankamon'in awoke. Surprised by the wonder of her revelation, she went outside the western gate to wait. A yellow ox came along, just as her dream had foretold. She took it and built a temple to the west of our own, where she tethered it and fed it assorted fragrant grasses. The Buddha spoke to her again as she was feeding and caring for the beast:

“Your mother was reborn as an ox because of her karma. She was expiating her transgressions and was to achieve human rebirth as a result. But since you have been honoring her as if she were your mother, she has actually been accumulating sin. You should hitch her to a cart like any other ox and have her pull heavy loads of lumber. If you do, she is sure to achieve liberation.”

In accord with her revelation, Ankamon'in hitched her mother to a cart and made her pull lumber. When the ox died, she held a funeral procession in its honor. She dressed it in funeral robes, and when the animal was eventually cremated, purple clouds spread in the sky, a mysterious fragrance filled the air, and a profusion of heavenly flowers fell from above—all true signs of her rebirth in the Pure Land.<sup>46</sup>

Filial piety is universally extolled in late medieval Japanese fictional and doctrinal sources. The *Lotus Sutra* commentary *Jikidan innenshū* 直談因縁集 (Straight Talk on Causes and Conditions; ca. 1585), for example, declares that “the Buddhas recognize filial piety” and reward it in kind,<sup>47</sup> which may explain why the Seiryōji Shakyamuni appears to Ankamon'in and informs her of her (former) mother's fate. Despite Ankamon'in's selfless intentions, her extraordinary care for the yellow ox risks dooming her mother to additional punishment in hell. The Seiryōji Shakyamuni explains that animals are animals because of their karma, and that to treat them otherwise may be harmful to them because of its potential to interfere with the natural expiation of their karma. Thus, while *Fuji no hitoana sōshi*, *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi*, and the *Jikidanshō* horse-mother story caution against the abuse of animals, *Seiryōji engi* warns of a different kind of mistreatment—inappropriate kindness—thereby helping to settle the existential question of how to treat our bestial brethren in a hierarchical world of transmigration.

#### CONCLUSION

So what did *Kumano bikuni* preach in regard to the animal realm? While it is impossible to invalidate Chikamatsu's representation of the imposter *Kumano*

*bikuni* Hōshōgaku's sermon in *Shume no hōgan Morihisa*—specifically, her assertion that those who engage in sex with monastics will be reborn as an “ignorant horse” or a “stupid ox”—there is also no obvious evidence to support it. Rather, as we have seen, it is more likely that *Kumano bikuni* preached upon the dangers of familial attachments in conjunction with their explanations of the animal realm. And while they may or may not have recounted specific stories of individuals who were reborn as either a horse or an ox (or as a goat, a snake, a dog, a deer, a fox, a crow, a rooster, or a clam, depending upon the contents of their own particular Kumano Mandala), judging from the variety and character of tales surviving in late medieval textual sources, they probably advocated—or perhaps even accepted commissions for—the performance of memorial services as a means of aiding the dead.<sup>48</sup> (Even in *Fuji no hitoana sōshi*, the Ten Kings are said to delay their judgment of the deceased until such time as devotions have or have not been received on their behalf.)<sup>49</sup> The didactic storytelling traditions of *Kumano bikuni* are now mostly lost to time, but it is thus possible, through comparative textual analysis, to reconstruct the likely tone and general contents of their seventeenth- and eighteenth-century expositions, allowing for an improved understanding of traditional Japanese conceptions of life, death, and the human and animal realms.

## NOTES

1. As of 27 November 2005 (the date of a *Kumano kanjin jikkai mandara* conference at the Okayama Library and Prefectural Museum), 49 different *Kumano kanjin jikkai mandara* had been identified; OGURISU Kenji lists 42 of these in OGURISU 2004a, 133. The 33 with fold marks include the 32 listed in OGURISU 2004a and the Formanek mandala in Vienna. For discussions of *Kumano bikuni*, see OGURISU 2004a, RUCH 2002, KURODA 1989, HAYASHI 1984, and HAGIWARA 1983. As Barbara RUCH (2002) has shown, not all of the women identified in painted and textual sources in the seventeenth and later centuries as “*Kumano bikuni*” were *etoki bikuni* 絵解比丘尼 (picture-explaining nuns), with which I am concerned here.

2. A *srāvaka* (*shōmon* 声聞) is a being that has attained enlightenment as a result of encountering the Buddhist Law; a *pratyekabuddha* (*engaku* 縁覚) has attained enlightenment spontaneously, simply by observing the world.

3. OGURISU Kenji (2004a) classifies extant Kumano Mandala as either “standard copies” (*teikei-bon* 定型本), “reproductions” (*mosha-bon* 模写本), or “variants” (*beppon* 別本). “Standard” mandala are characterized by the presence of fold marks and, at the top of the “hill of age,” cedar trees; 32 of the 42 Kumano Mandala listed in OGURISU 2004a are standards. OGURISU subdivides these 32 into three lineages: *kōhon* 甲本 (of which there are 10); *otsuhon* 乙本 (15); and *heihon* 丙本 (1). OGURISU argues that the standard mandala were mass-produced in professional studios (*kōbō* 工房) between the mid-to-late seventeenth and mid-to-late eighteenth centuries. “Reproductions” preserve the layout of the standard copies, but lack fold marks and appear to have been produced with different materials; OGURISU identifies four of these, which he suggests were painted from around the mid-to-



late eighteenth century. “Variants” are idiosyncratic; OGURISU identifies six of these, some of which appear to date from the early-to-mid seventeenth century and to preserve the Kumano Mandala in its earlier stages of development (its pre-standard form).

4. As KURODA Hideo has explained (2004, 109–10), the lines also suggest the Tendai Buddhist concept of *ichinen sanzen* 一念三千 (three thousand in a single thought), according to which all phenomena (represented by the number 3000) are contained within the single human heart-mind. Kuroda writes that one of the implications of this idea is that “any ordinary person possesses the potential to attain Buddhahood,” and that it is therefore “up to the individual heart or mind whether a person falls into *jigoku* [hell], or is able to attain Buddhahood.” Kuroda asserts that the Kumano Mandala “was centered around such a doctrine.”

5. For a thorough discussion of the contents of the Kumano Mandala, see KURODA 1989 and 2004.

6. Of the 37 Kumano Mandala photographically reproduced in OGURISU 2004a, only the Kōzenji 興善寺 and Sairaiji 西来寺 paintings depict the horse and the ox without human heads. See OGURISU 2004a, 202 and 227.

7. See, for example, the description of the blood pool hell in the late-Muromachi-period British Library text of *Tengu no dairi* 天狗の内裏 (TSUJI 1999, 361a), and the description of the two-wives hell in the 1607 text of *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* 富士の人穴草子 (MJMS 2: 325b). For a discussion of women and the blood-pool hell, see KIMBROUGH forthcoming (chapter 8), WILLIAMS 2005, 50–58 and 125–28, and MOERMAN 2005, 221–31.

8. KURODA 1989, 243. KURODA cites the thirteenth-century *rokudō-e* 六道絵 paintings in the possession of Shōjuraigōji 聖衆来迎寺, and the late-Kamakura-period (early fourteenth century) *rokudō-e* in the possession of Gokurakuji 極楽寺. For a discussion of the animal realm in the Shōjuraigōji *rokudō-e*, see KASUYA 1995.

9. Although the painting is not specifically identified as such, HAYASHI Masahiko and OGURISU Kenji are persuaded that it was a *Kumano kanjin jikkai mandara*. HAYASHI 1986, 326; OGURISU 2004a, 143a and 188, note 92.

10. CHIKAMATSU ZENSHŪ KANKŌKAI 1985, 488. For an English-language summary of the passage, see KAMINISHI 2005, 143.

11. NST 6: 32–33 and 330b–331a. For an alternate translation of this and the larger animal realm passage, see REISCHAUER 1930, 49–50. The twelfth-century Taira no Yasuyori 平康頼 echoes Genshin’s words in his own influential *Hōbutsushū* 宝物集 (“A collection of treasures;” ca. 1179), and he stresses the difficulty for sentient beings to escape from the bestial plane. Unlike Genshin, to whose *Ōjō yōshū* he refers his readers, Yasuyori lists seven Japanese poems (*waka* 和歌) that pertain to animals and the animal realm. SNKBT 40: 66 and 71–74.

12. DNBZ 31: 167b, line 1. The date and attribution of *Kanjin ryakuyōshū* is according to *Kokusho sōmoku* 2: 328a. Although the work is traditionally attributed to Genshin, his authorship of it is in fact uncertain. See *Nihon koten bungaku daijiten* 2: 71a.

13. Such works include *Mokuren no sōshi* 目連の草紙, *Daibutsu no go-engi* 大仏の御縁起, *Tengu no dairi*, *Fuji no hitoana sōshi*, *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi* 長宝寺よみがへりの草紙, and, to a lesser extent, *Bishamon no honji* 毘沙門の本地. For analyses of these, see TOKUDA 2002 and KIMBROUGH 2006a.

14. MJMS 2: 336b. In the woodblock-printed *Fuji* text of 1627, the Bodhisattva explicitly states that the scrolls contain painted representations of hell and the Pure Land (MJMT 11: 473b). *Fuji no hitoana sōshi* (1603 manuscript) is translated in KIMBROUGH 2006b.

15. NISHINO 1971, 42a–43b. *Fuji no hitoana sōshi*’s preoccupation with women’s punish-

ments has led Nishino to suggest that it was disseminated by women who preached in a confessional mode.

16. KOYAMA 1983, 38 and 48–50. Koyama proposes that *Fuji no hitoana sōshi*'s preoccupation with women's punishments suggests that the story was intended for recitation to women, rather than by women (50 and 55).

17. NISHINO 1971, 40b–42a; KOYAMA 1983, 47. The six early texts, all of which are unillustrated, are the five listed in NISHINO 1971, 38b, and the late-Muromachi-period Keio University manuscript, typeset in ISHIKAWA 1997.

18. *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi*'s preoccupation with the supernatural provenance of Chōhōji temple treasures lends it the tone of a temple *engi* 縁起, a mytho-history typically employed in temple-based preaching and fund-raising. HASHIMOTO Naoki (1986, 43) goes so far as to claim that *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi* is a more authentic (original) *engi* than the eponymous *Chōhōji engi* 長宝寺縁起 of Genbun 元文 2 (1737). Chōhōji's ownership of two seventeenth century *engi*-type works containing condensed versions of Keishin's story (*Enma-ō no o-han narabi ni kumo shari no engi* えんま王の御はん并蜘蛛舍利乃縁起, and *Yomigaeri no sōshi kōgaisho* よみがへりの草紙梗概書) further suggests that the story was employed in Chōhōji preaching. See HASHIMOTO 1996, and, concerning Chōhōji's *Gyakushukō engi* 逆修講縁起 (an additional seventeenth-century *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi*-related text), HASHIMOTO 1980. *Chōhōji yomigaeri no sōshi* is also known by the title of *Hirano yomigaeri no sōshi* 平野よみがへりの草子.

19. *Gyakushu* 逆修 ("reverse rites," or "reverse-order rites") are (theoretically) posthumous rites commissioned by the beneficiary for the beneficiary's well-being in the next life, and performed while the beneficiary is still alive. NAKAMURA 2001, 1: 272d–73a.

20. SNKBZ 63: 419 and 42. As Keishin walks the road of death, she suddenly discovers the *vajra* walking stick that she used on her pilgrimage to Kumano. Then, upon encountering Enma, Enma demands to know of her pilgrimage there.

21. SNKBZ 63: 420 and 432. In some cases, demons employ horses and oxen as tools of torture. For example, Keishin describes the following punishment for "people who commit many sins of speech, whether telling a myriad lies, slandering the Buddhas and the sutras, or disparaging priests": "A demon pulled a man's tongue far out of his mouth. Then, after stretching it wide and staking down the edges, he used a team of horses and oxen to plow it apart. Insects seized upon the man's tattered organ, stinging and gorging themselves in a way that was impossible to describe." SNKBZ 63: 432.

22. SNKBZ 63: 443. Similarly, the Buddhist tale anthology *Shasekishū* 沙石集 (ca. 1280) contains multiple accounts of falcons who are devoured by their former prey at the time of their deaths. NKBT 85: 309–10; MORRELL 1985, 206.

23. Self-practice sects (*shōdōmon* 聖道門) constitute all non-Pure Land (*nenbutsu*) sects, because they rely upon self-power, rather than the other-power of Amida Buddha, to attain enlightenment. NKD 10: 594a; ISHIDA 1997, 582c.

24. ISHIKAWA 1997, 36a–b (late Muromachi-period Keio University Library text); MJMT 11: 462b (woodblock-printed text of 1627). In other places, Nitta sees a hybrid snake-man being tortured by two hybrid snake-women for having kept two wives in the human world (the "two-wives hell," also depicted in the Kumano Mandala), and he sees demons hunting sinners with packs of iron dogs for the sins of laziness and envy. MJMT 11: 438b and 440a–b (1603 *Fuji* text).

25. *Kushōjin* are pairs of Buddhist deities that affix themselves to a person's right and left shoulders at the time of a person's birth and then record the person's good and bad deeds upon "good" and "bad" tablets throughout the person's life. When the person dies, the deities report their findings to Enma. NAKAMURA 2001, 1: 334a.

26. The Ten Kings (*Jūō* 十王), including Enma, are the ten judges of the dead. NKD 10: 230b.

27. *Muken jigoku* 無間地獄 (Skt. *Avīci*) is the deepest and worst of the eight burning hells, where evildoers are tortured constantly without intermission. NAKAMURA 2001, 3: 1615d.

28. A *kalpa* (*kō* 劫) is a measurement of time which Nāgārjuna (ca. 150–250) describes in his commentary *Daichidoron* 大智度論 as being greater than the time that it takes for a heavenly being to wear away a 40 *ri* 里 (one hundred square mile) rock by brushing it with its delicate sleeve once every one hundred years. NAKAMURA 2001, 1: 423b.

29. Conversely, the late Muromachi-period *otogizōshi Daibutsu no go-engi*, which TOKUDA Kazuo writes was likely employed in preaching to women about women's salvation (TOKUDA 2002, 327a), explains that “those who mistreat their parents or fail to perform memorial services on their behalf will become seven-colored snakes. They'll fall into a hell where they'll feed themselves to others, and eat others in turn.” MJMT 8: 443a.

30. NKBT 85: 330. Translation modified from MORRELL 1985, 216. Mujū expresses this opinion within the context of a story about an otherwise righteous lay devotee who was reborn as a *mushi* 蟲 (an insect or a worm) as a result of his extraordinary devotion to his wife. In another tale, Mujū tells of a mother who was reborn as a horse as a result of her emotional attachment to her daughter (NKBT 85: 384–86; MORRELL 1985, 239–40).

31. The 33 “standard” mandala are the 32 listed in OGURISU 2004a, 147 and 151a, and the Formanek mandala in Vienna. See note 3, above. OGURISU identifies the Kumano Mandala that do and do not contain the neck-pillory scene in his table on pages 146–47, column 26 (his table does not include the Formanek mandala).

32. KURODA 1989, 258; OGURISU 2004a, 141a. Also see NKD 4: 105a. The three worlds (*sangai* 三界) are the three worlds through which unenlightened beings transmigrate according to their karma; the six realms are included within the world of desire (*yokkai* 欲界), the lowest of the three. ISHIDA 1997, 365b.

33. According to OGURISU 2004a, 146, column 26, the neck-pillory scene is set to the upper right of the animal realm in 22 out of the 27 standard mandala that he observed to contain it, and to the right of Enma's court in the remaining five.

34. OGURISU points in particular (2004 b, 12–17) to the post-*Rokudō Chinnōji kō-hon* 六道珍皇寺甲本 and post-*Kōzenji-bon* 興善寺本 appearance of the cloud-riding demon in the upper-left corner, Enma's court in the middle-left, and the neck-pillory scene. For OGURISU's identification of the *Rokudō Chinnōji kō-hon* and *Kōzenji-bon* as two proto-standard Kumano Mandala (the latter being further evolved than the former) see OGURISU 2004a, 139b and 171a; 2004 b, 12–17.

35. IKEYAMA 1979, 6–7. On Eishin's affiliation with Sugaoji, see IKEYAMA 1979, 1.

36. Such commentaries are known collectively as *jikidan* 直談 (“straight talk”)–type works. Eishin himself writes that “*jikidan* means explaining things frankly, just like the Buddha preached” (*Jikidanshō* 1989, 1: 32). Other *jikidan*-type *Lotus Sutra* commentaries include *Ichijō shūgyokushō* 一乘拾玉抄 (1488); *Hokekyō jurin shūyōshō* 法華經鷲林拾葉鈔 (1512); and *Jikidan innenshū* 直談因縁集 (ca. 1585). For discussions of these, see HIROTA 1993 and 1997, and KIMBROUGH forthcoming (chapter 5).

37. LÉVI-STRAUSS 1963, 89; cited in LONG 2005, 24.

38. *Jikidanshō* 1989, 1: 483–84 (about a monkey); 2: 575–76 (about 500 monkeys); 2: 349–51 (about 500 bats); 3: 220–21 (about ten bats); 3: 221–22 (about ten monkeys); and 3: 524 (about a dog; a variant of the early twelfth-century *Konjaku monogatari shū* 今昔物語集 14: 18 [SNKBT 35: 319–21], which concerns a cow rather than a dog). In addition, a story in *Jikidanshō* 1989, 1: 290 tells of an elephant who became calm upon hearing Buddhist

preaching, and a story in 3: 30 concerns a turtle who lost his life as a result of losing his temper.

39. *Jikidanshō* 1989, 1: 518 (about a man who was reborn as a dragon, and another man who was reborn as an insect); and 2: 444 (about a man who was reborn as a hundred-headed fish for having lost his temper in a debate with one of the Buddha's disciples).

40. *Jikidanshō* 1989, 3: 519–20. Also see the photographic reproductions of the Myōhōin 妙法院 and Sochiku Bunko 疎竹文庫 manuscripts in *Hokekyō jikidanshō: Koshahon shūsei* 1989, 4: 1125–26 and 5: 1085.

41. *Jikidanshō* 1989, 2: 72. Eishin's explanation follows that of the Tendai scholar-priest Sonshun 尊舜 in his *Hokekyō jurin shūyōshō* of 1512 (*Jurin shūyōshō* 1991, 2: 169–70). Like Sonshun, Eishin also cites a passage that he attributes to the *Shōbōnenjokyō* 正法念處經 sutra to the effect that “there are two billion types of animals, some with long lives, some with short, and none of them the same. Some make their homes in the water, and some on the land.” According to KAMATA 1998, 219a, the *Shōbōnenjokyō* describes the animal realm in its eighteenth through twenty-first chapters, and was an important source for Genshin's own *Ōjō yōshū*.

42. *Jikidanshō* 1989, 2: 72, quoting a passage in DNBZ 31: 167b (cited in note 12, above). For another, similar *Jikidanshō* explanation of the animal realm, see *Jikidanshō* 2: 124.

43. *Sangoku denki* 6: 17, in IKEGAMI 1997, 332–33. *Sangoku denki* was compiled by Gento 玄棟, a Tendai priest who seems to have been affiliated with the Kashiwabara 柏原 *dangisho* (otherwise known as Jōbodai'in 成菩提院), a major Tendai instructional center in the Sakata region of Ōmi. KOBAYASHI 2004, 153.

44. From *Shasekishū* (ca. 1280), NKBT 85: 386–87; MORRELL 1985, 240.

45. NARA KOKURITSU HAKUBTSUKAN 1975, 186b. The Seiryōji temple complex is located on the Saga 嵯峨 plain near the western edge of the Kyoto valley. Its *engi* may have been composed for use in fund-raising efforts for temple reconstruction after Seiryōji's partial destruction in the Ōnin Disturbance 応仁の乱 of 1467–1477. *Seiryōji engi*, also known as *Shakadō engi* 釈迦堂縁起, is photographically reproduced in NARA KOKURITSU HAKUBTSUKAN 1975, 274–309.

46. DNBZ 117: 480b–81b; ZGR 27: 1: 406a–407a; NARA KOKURITSU HAKUBTSUKAN 1975, 303b–302c. *Seiryōji engi* includes no illustration of this or any other story in fascicle six.

47. ABE 1998, 231–32. *Jikidan innenshū*'s date of composition is unknown; according to a colophon, the surviving manuscript was transcribed by the priest Shun'yū 舜雄 in the eighth month of Tenshō 天正 13 (1585). The colophon is transcribed in ABE 1998, 2.

48. There is evidence (although ultimately inconclusive) to suggest that *Kumano bikuni* may have sometimes contracted to perform such services themselves. According to an inscription dated the third month of Meiwa 明和 3 (1766) on the back of a Kumano Mandala in the possession of Heirakuji 平楽寺 in Mie 三重 prefecture, the mandala was given to the temple after the death of its owner, a nun (*ama* 尼) who “hung the image on the wall of her chamber and meditated on it night and day. Performing the sole practice of the nenbutsu (*nenbutsu zanmai* 念仏三昧), she eventually achieved Pure Land rebirth.” A second inscription (dated Taishō 大正 9 [1920]) identifies the nun as Myōshin-ni 妙真尼, and explains that she was a cemetery caretaker (*hakamori* 塚守) at a local estate (OGURISU 2004a, 177). OGURISU Kenji and HANIOKA Mayumi posit that Myōshin-ni was a *Kumano bikuni*, and that in her retirement from itinerant preaching, she performed memorial services as a part of her grave-minding duties (OGURISU 2004a, 177–78 and 181a; HANIOKA 2005, 97a).

49. MJMT 11: 447a (1603 *Fuji* text); MJMT 11: 472a (1627 *Fuji* text); KIMBROUGH 2006, 251.

## REFERENCES CITED

## ABBREVIATIONS

- DNBZ Bussho Kankōkai 仏書刊行会, ed. *Dai Nihon Bukkyō zensho* 大日本佛教全書. 150 vols. Tokyo: Bussho Kankōkai, 1912–1922.
- MJMS Yokoyama Shigeru 横山重, ed. *Muromachi jidai monogatari shū* 室町時代物語集. 5 vols. Tokyo: Inoue Shobō, 1962.
- MJMT Yokoyama Shigeru and Matsumoto Ryūshin 松本隆信, eds. *Muromachi jidai monogatari taisei* 室町時代物語大成. 13 vols. Tokyo: Kadokawa Shoten, 1973–1985. Also 2 supp. vols. ed. by Matsumoto Ryūshin, 1987–1988.
- NKBT *Nihon koten bungaku taikai* 日本古典文学大系. 100 vols. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1958–1968.
- NKD *Nihon kokugo daijiten* 日本国語大辞典. 20 vols. Nihon Daijiten Kankōkai 日本大辞典刊行会, ed. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1972–1976.
- NST *Nihon shisō taikai* 日本思想体系. 67 vols. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1970–1982.
- SNKBT *Shin Nihon koten bungaku taikai* 新日本古典文学大系. 100 vols. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1989–2005.
- SNKBZ *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 新編日本古典文学全集. 88 vols. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1994–.
- ZGR Hanawa Hokiichi 塙保己一 et al., eds. *Zoku gunsho ruijū* 続群書類従. 34 vols. Tokyo: Zoku Gunsho Ruijū Kanseikai, 1929–1933.

## OTHER WORKS

ABE Yasurō 阿部泰郎 et al., eds.

1998 *Nikkō tenkaizō Jikidan innenshū: Honkoku to sakuin* 日光天海藏直談因縁集—翻刻と索引. Kenkyū sōsho 研究叢書, no. 225. Osaka: Izumi Shoin.

CHIKAMATSU ZENSHŪ KANKŌKAI 近松全集刊行会

1985 *Chikamatsu zenshū* 近松全集. Vol. 1. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten.

HAGIWARA Tatsuo 萩原龍夫

1983 *Miko to Bukkyō shi: Kumano bikuni no shimei to tenkai* 巫女と仏教史—熊野比丘尼の使命と展開. Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kōbunkan.

HANIOKA Mayumi 埴岡真弓

2005 “Sakura no shita no sō” to sono haikai: *Kumano kanjin jikkai mandara ni miru setsuwa-teki imēji* 「桜の下の僧」とその背景—「熊野観心十界曼荼羅」にみる説話的イメージ. *Etoki kenkyū* 19: 77–106.

HASHIMOTO Naoki 橋本直紀

1980 “Gyakushukō engi” to jūō, jūsanbutsu 「逆修講縁起」と十王・十三仏. *Senriyama bungaku ronshū* 千里山文学論集 24: 15–30.



- 1986 Engi to katarimono: *Jūōkyō* to otogizōshi, dangibon 縁起と語り物—十王経と御伽草子・談義本. *Kokubungaku: kaishaku to kanshō* 51, no. 4: 43–48.
- 1996 Sakuhinron: *Hirano yomigaeri no sōshi* 作品論—「平野よみがへりの草子」. *Kokubungaku: kaishaku to kanshō* 国文学—解釈と鑑賞 61, no. 5: 71–75.
- HAYASHI Masahiko 林雅彦
- 1984 *Zōho Nihon no etoki: Shiryō to kenkyū* 増補日本の絵解き—資料と研究. Tokyo: Miyai Shoten.
- 1986 Kumano bikuni to etoki 熊野比丘尼と絵解き. *Bukkyō minzokugaku taikai 2: Hijiri to minshū* 仏教民俗学大系2—聖と民衆, ed. Hagiwara Tatsuo 萩原龍夫 and Shinno Toshikazu 真野俊和, 309–30. Tokyo: Meicho Shuppan.
- HIROTA Tetsumichi 廣田哲通
- 1993 *Chūsei Hokekyō chūshakusho no kenkyū* 中世法華経注釈書の研究. Tokyo: Kasama Shoin.
- 1997 *Tendai danjo de Hokekyō o yomu* 天台談所で法華経を読む. Tokyo: Kanrin Shobō.
- Hokekyō jikidanshō: Koshahon shūsei* 法華経直談鈔—古写本集成
- 1989 14 vols. Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten.
- IKEGAMI Jun'ichi 池上洵一, ed.
- 1997 *Sangoku denki* 三国伝記. Vol. 1. Tokyo: Miyai Shoten. First published in 1987.
- KEYAMA Issaien 池山一切圓
- 1979 Kaidai 解題. In *Hokekyō jikidanshō* 法華経直談鈔, vol. 1, 1–12. Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten.
- ISHIDA Mizumaro 石田瑞磨
- 1997 *Reibun Bukkyōgo daijiten* 例文仏教語大辞典. Tokyo: Shōgakukan.
- ISHIKAWA Tōru 石川 透
- 1997 Keiō gijuku toshokan-zō *Hitoana sōshi* kaidai, honkoku 慶應義塾図書館蔵『人あなごうし』解題・翻刻. *Mita kokubun* 26: 31–44.
- Jikidanshō* 直談鈔
- 1989 *Hokekyō jikidanshō* 法華経直談鈔. 3 vols. Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten.
- Jurin shūyōshō* 鶯林拾葉鈔
- 1991 *Hokekyō jurin shūyōshō* 法華経鶯林拾葉鈔. 4 vols. Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten.
- KAMATA Shigeo 鎌田茂雄 et al., eds.
- 1998 *Daizōkyō zenkaisetsu daijiten* 大藏経全解説大事典. Tokyo: Yūzankaku Shuppan.
- KAMINISHI, Ikumi
- 2005 *Explaining Pictures: Buddhist Propaganda and Etoki Storytelling in Japan*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press.
- KASUYA Makoto 加須屋誠
- 1995 Shōjuraigōji-bon rokudō-e *chikushōdō-zu shiken* 聖衆来迎寺本六道絵「畜生道図」私見. *Tezukayama Gakuin Daigaku kenkyū ronshū* 30: 38–67.
- KIMBROUGH, R. Keller
- 2006a Tourists in paradise: Writing the Pure Land in medieval Japanese fiction. *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 33: 269–96.
- 2006b Translation: The Tale of the Fuji Cave. *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 33, no. 2 (online supplement): 1–22.

- Forthcoming *Preachers, Poets, Women & the Way: Izumi Shikibu and the Buddhist Literature of Medieval Japan*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Center for Japanese Studies.
- KOBAYASHI Naoki 小林直樹  
 2004 *Sangoku denki no seiritsu kiban: Hokke jikidan no sekai to no kōshō* 「三国伝記」の成立基盤—法華直談の世界との交渉. In *Chūsei setsuwashū to sono kiban* 中世説話集とその基盤, 121–65. Osaka: Izumi Shoin.
- Kokusho sōmokuroku* 国書総目録  
 1963–1972 8 vols. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten.
- KOYAMA Issei 小山一成  
 1983 *Fuji no hitoana sōshi: Kenkyū to shiryō* 富士の人穴草子—研究と資料. Tokyo: Bunka Shobō Hakubunsha.
- KURODA Hideo 黒田日出男  
 1989 *Kumano kanjin jikkai mandara no uchū* 熊野観心十界曼荼羅の宇宙. In *Bukkyō to Nihonjin*, vol. 8: *Sei to mibun* 仏教と日本人 8—性と身分, ed. Miyata Noboru 宮田 登, 206–73. Tokyo: Shunjūsha, 1989.  
 2004 The *Kumano kanshin jikkai mandara* and the lives of the people in early modern Japan, trans. Haruko Wakabayashi. In *Practicing the Afterlife: Perspectives from Japan*, ed. Formanek, Susanne, and William R. LaFleur, 101–20. Vienna: Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften.
- LÉVI-STRAUSS, Claude  
 1963 *Totemism*, trans. Rodney Needham. Boston: Beacon Press.
- LONG, Hoyt  
 2005 Grateful animal or spiritual being? Buddhist gratitude tales and changing conceptions of deer in early Japan. In *JAPANimals: History and Culture in Japan's Animal Life*, ed. Pflugfelder, Gregory M., and Brett L. Walker, 21–58. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Center for Japanese Studies.
- MOERMAN, D. Max  
 2005 *Localizing Paradise: Kumano Pilgrimage and the Religious Landscape of Premodern Japan*. Cambridge and London: Harvard University Asia Center
- MORRELL, Robert E.  
 1985 *Sand and Pebbles (Shasekishū): The Tales of Mujū Ichien, A Voice for Pluralism in Kamakura Buddhism*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- NAKAMURA Hajime 中村 元  
 2001 *Kōsetsu Bukkyōgo daijiten* 広説佛教語大辞典. 3 vols. Tokyo: Tōkyō Shoseki.
- NARA KOKURITSU HAKUBUTSUKAN 奈良国立博物館, ed.  
 1975 *Shaji engi-e* 社寺縁起絵. Tokyo: Kadokawa Shoten.
- Nihon Koten Bungaku Daijiten* 日本古典文学大辞  
 1983–1985 6 vols. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten.
- NISHINO Toshiko 西野登志子  
 1971 *Fuji no hitoana sōshi no keisei* 「富士の人穴草子」の形成. *Ōtani joshidai kokubun* 1: 38–48.
- OGURISU Kenji 小栗栖健治  
 2004a *Kumano kanjin jikkai mandara no seiritsu to tenkai* 熊野観心十界曼荼羅の成立と展開. *Hyōgo kenritsu rekishi hakubutsukan kiyō: Jinkai* 15: 129–242.  
 2004b *Kumano kanjin jikkai mandara zuzō no seiritsu katei o megutte*: Shiga-ken

Kōzenji-bon o chūshin ni 「熊野観心十界曼荼羅」 図像の成立過程をめぐって  
滋賀県・興善寺本を中心に. *Ōmi chihō shi kenkyū* 36: 3–18.

REISCHAUER, A. K.

1930 Genshin's *Ōjō yōshū*: Collected essays on birth into paradise. *The Transactions of the Asiatic Society of Japan*. Second Series, vol. VII: 16–97.

RUCH, Barbara

2002 Woman to woman: *Kumano bikuni* proselytizers in medieval and early modern Japan. In *Engendering Faith: Women and Buddhism in Premodern Japan*, ed. Ruch, Barbara, 537–80. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Center for Japanese Studies.

TOKUDA Kazuo 徳田和夫

2002 *Otogizōshi jiten* お伽草子事典. Tokyo: Tōkyōdō Shuppan.

TSUJI Eiko 辻 英子

1999 *Zaigai Nihon emaki no kenkyū to shiryō* 在外日本絵巻の研究と資料. Kasama sōsho, no. 328. Tokyo: Kasama Shoin.

WILLIAMS, Duncan Ryūken

2005 *The Other Side of Zen: A Social History of Sōtō Zen Buddhism in Tokugawa Japan*. Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press.