# BOOK REVIEWS

Instead of martial arts (*bungei*), Nishiyama chose to emphasize the arts of leisure (*yūgei*). Instead of looking at the artistic and scholarly achievements of the elite, he focused on acrobats, storytellers, mimes, dancers, and conjurers. Nishiyama contested the oft-repeated notion that Edo period Japan was in a state of decline and decadence by the time of the coming of Perry's black ships. Instead it is precisely this period, the early nineteenth century, when Edo culture had reached its fullest flower.

Instead of the manufacture of iron and the introduction of the factory system, Nishiyama is concerned with the development of hybrid morning glories. It is a nostalgic view of the past, but an important reminder that the samurai class with its economic failings is only one of many narratives that can be told about the Edo period. According to Nishiyama,

The development of hybrid morning glories was just one element of a refined and broadly based culture in which a high premium was placed on handmade articles. This culture included *ukiyo-e* woodcuts, flyers and chapbooks, the kabuki, storytelling, clothing, gardening, and much else. That this culture has often been labeled "decadent" merely reflects bias or sloppy and myopic research methods. Decadence can of course be found here; but the creative urge of the common citizenry of this era was nothing if not sound and healthy. (18–19)

Much credit for the success of this book must go to the translator and editor, Gerald Groemer, who currently teaches at Yamanashi University. Not only is the subject matter difficult, but Nishiyama's academic style does not easily translate into English academic prose. The original is littered with repetition and connections between sentences or paragraphs are rough. Moreover, Nishiyama rarely comes to a synthetic conclusion; as Groemer puts it, "these chapters simply stop when Nishiyama has run out of things to say" (3). Finally, documentation in the original was often lacking. Thus, in preparing the English text, Groemer, with the author's permission and cooperation, has rewritten, and sometimes changed sentence and paragraph order. While not adding anything new, he has added summaries of the main points at the end of several of the chapters. And he has added valuable notes. As Groemer himself admits, his work is more of an adaptation than a translation, but readers will be grateful for his efforts. Indeed, the notes, glossary of terms, bibliography of sources in Japanese and English, and index may make the English version of Nishiyama's essays far more accessible and useful than the Japanese originals.

> M. William STEELE International Christian University Mitaka, Tokyo

TURNBULL, STEPHEN. The Kakure Kirishitan of Japan: A Study of Their Development, Beliefs, and Rituals to the Present Day. Richmond, Surrey: Curzon (Japan Library), 1998. xii + 296 pages. Maps, figures, illustrations, appendices, bibliography, Japanese character list, index. Cloth £40.OO; ISBN 1-873410-70-0.

The past decade has witnessed a burgeoning interest in Japan's Kakure Kirishitan ("hidden" Christians) on the part of scholars in Europe, Japan, and the United States. It is also a timely

# BOOK REVIEWS

interest since the Kakure Kirishitan are declining in numbers, activity, and even in the memory of their own once-cherished traditions. As translator of their Bible, *The Beginning of Heaven and Earth: The Sacred Book of Japan's Hidden Christians*, and producer of an ethnographic film of their Christmas Eve ceremony (*Otaiya*), I have also had occasion to meet the author of the present book under review. In his Introduction Turnbull notes that since I was already engaged in research on the Gotō Islands' Kakure Kirishitan he decided to base his study on another community—Ikitsuki. Judging from his excellent book this was a wise decision, for the Ikitsuki communities possess numerous paintings, artifacts, and a more populous congregation than that found in the Gotō Islands.

Stephen Turnbull's *The Kakure Kirishitan of Japan* is indeed a contribution to the preservation and documentation of the traditions of the Kakure Kirishitan. It also comes as a surprise from an author of sixteen books on Japanese military history. With a lens focused on Ikitsuki (the community most open to outsiders), Turnbull describes comprehensively and in much valuable detail its history, social organization, and rituals. The work also touches on the practices in neighboring Hirado, and the legends found in Sotome. Included as well are twelve pages of black and white photographs of art objects, ceremonies, ritual foods, and of the Kakure Kirishitan themselves.

The book analyzes the influences that have led to the creation, preservation, and development of the underground faith. With this in mind, three hypotheses are presented and tested throughout the book. The first suggests that the religion represents the preservation of a sixteenth-century form of Catholicism modified by its surroundings. The second maintains that the religion represents a radical transformation and acculturation of Christianity within the Japanese milieu. According to the third, the religion represents the abandonment of Christianity and adherence to a new religion through the blending of indigenous traditions.

The strength of Turnbull's study is its synthesis of Japanese historical sources both remote and proximal. From these, together with participant observation, Turnbull offers some provocative insights that show the blurring of traditions characteristic of the sect. For example, he views the practice of prayers for the souls in Purgatory as facilitating the continuation of ancestor worship into Japanese Christianity. As complementary practices they both serve to enhance the social ties between the living and the dead. Or the contemporary hierarchical organization of Kakure Kirishitan officials (*chōkata, mizukata, and kikikata*) he traces to the early nonclerical hierarchy of the *iruman, dōjuku*, and *kanbō*. As baptism was the only sacrament that could be performed by a layperson, it became central to the orphaned church.

The Kakure Kirishitan of Japan concludes by attempting to place the Kakure Kirishitan into a more global framework. Turnbull ultimately poses the question as to whether or not they can legitimately be considered "Christian." Such an assessment first requires the difficult task of defining what it means to be a Christian. The author rejects Ninian Smart's broad definition of "Christianity as Christianities" in favor of Hans Küng's more conservative one—nearness to the center defined as Jesus Christ. The Kakure Kirishitan religion like many other forms of popular Catholicism is Marian in orientation. For this reason, the Kakure Kirishitan's relegation of Christ to the periphery automatically disqualifies them as Christians.

Turnbull thus finds the importance of the Kakure Kirishitan to be largely symbolic. Because they are isolated, unknown, and without an evangelistic aspect to their faith, the author concludes that they do not serve as a positive force for Christianity in the world today. Yet they continue to symbolize for others a spiritual tenacity. The irony is that this value is expressed largely on their behalf by outsiders.

The Kakure Kirishitan of Japan is a thoughtful book that contains a wealth of information. It should be read by anyone interested in questions of faith, Christian theology, Christian history, missiology, or Japanese religions.

### BOOK REVIEWS

REFERENCES CITED

# WHELAN, Christal.

- 1997 Otaiya. VHS Distributor: Documentary Educational Resources. (http://der.org/docued)
- 1996 The Beginning of Heaven and Earth: The Sacred Book of Japan's Hidden Christians. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press.

Christal WHELAN University of Hawaii

# CHINA

LI SHUJIANG and KARL W. LUCKERT. *Mythology and Folklore of the Hui: A Muslim Chinese People*. New York: State University of New York Press, 1994. xii + 459 pages. Map, b/w photographs, bibliography, index. Paper US\$21.95; ISBN 0-7914-1824-3.

The book under review is the first publication in English on the folklore of the Hui, the Chinese Muslims. The authors accept the official Chinese definition of the Hui as an ethnic minority even though it is questionable for several reasons. First, the language of the Hui usually does not differ from the language spoken by their Han Chinese neighbors. Second, anthropologically speaking the group includes Han Chinese as well as Iranians, Turks, possibly also Manchus and Mongols, and in South China even Arab and Malay elements (CHEBOKSAROV 1965, 87). What all these people share is not an ethnic origin but a religion, Islam. Ethnographers group them according to the areas where they live in three (or four) rather distinct large subgroups: the most populous is the one of north and northwest China (Ninxia, Xinjang, Qinghai, Gansu, Shaanxi, Beijing, and Tianjin), followed by the subgroups of southeast China (Shanghai, Guangzhou) and southwest China (Yunnan and parts of Sichuan). Another very small subgroup is found in two villages of Zat speakers (a language quite different from Chinese) on Hainan, but this group is not represented by any tale in the volume.

The volume assembles translations of 123 tales arranged according to themes such as "The Primeval Ancestors of the Muslims," "Muhammad and his Companions," "The Quest of Culture Heroes and Saviors"—to mention just the themes of the first three chapters. Although reasons may be given to justify such an arrangement, it makes comparison with narrative folklore of other groups difficult, since it disregards more formal aspects such as narrative genres like various types of legends (e.g., Koranic, toponymic, and historic legends) and tales (e.g., fairy tales, novelistic tales, and animal tales). It is further regrettable that the authors do not always supply the usual data, such as the names of the narrator and of the one who recorded the text, or the location where the narrative was recorded. Nor do they supply references to earlier Chinese publications, although many of the stories were published in an earlier anthology compiled by Lt Shujiang (1988), one of the authors.

The introduction is generally informative and contains many interesting discourses about Hui mythology and tales. However, one would have wished for a general discussion of the characteristics of Hui folklore and a short history of its collection. In that manner the work of several indigenous and Russian scholars who have studied Hui groups since the end of the nineteenth century could have been put to good use. My own volume (RIFTIN 1977), in particular the introduction that has gone through several printings in Chinese, could have

#### 370