BOOK REVIEWS


The program in Comparative Studies in Ethnicity and Nationality (CSEN), at the School of International Studies, University of Washington, is conducting annual seminars on the rise and decline of ethnic identities among peoples around the world since 1972. The present volume grew out of such a seminar where the participants investigated people who were forced to adapt to radical change be it the result of migration, state expansion and national integration or revolutionary changes in polity and economy. The papers are based on empirical data from Great Britain (among the Welsh), Canada (among the French-speaking Acadians), the United States (among the American Indians and the Asian-Americans), South Asia (among non-Brahmins in southern India), Southeast Asia (among Malays in multiethnic Malaysia, and the Sulu in the Philippines), North Africa (among the Jews in Morocco and Tunisia), the Middle East (among Arabs in Israel) and West Africa (among Creoles in Sierra Leone). The contributors are mainly anthropologists but there are also one economist, one political scientist and two sociologists among them.

Charles F. Keyes, who is also the editor of this book, explores the dialectics and theoretical approaches to the study of ethnic change. He gives a cultural interpretation to ethnicity as a *primordial* characteristic of identity, to which he adds social manipulation of ethnicity in the pursuit of objective interests. Ethnic change is seen as a dialectical process which begins when people experience a radical shift in their social circumstances. Keyes conceives the primordial attachment between people, which has been explained already by Geertz as the "given" at birth (Geertz 1963). This includes sex, locality, and time of birth. Physiological features are recognized as marks of biological inheritance. Cultural interpretation of descent and other symbols of ethnicity are taught to children. But what happens when these attitudes require reconsideration in a multi-ethnic society? Another variable then plays a role in social action, it is the access to the means of production.

Michael Banton challenges the concept of "assimilation" which seems to apply only to groups and not to individuals. According to him, assimilation should be seen as the "reduction of cultural distance between specified groups with respect to some particular aspects of their behavior." The opposite process would be where, again with respect to some aspects of their behavior, groups increase the cultural distance between them.

Ethnic succession is the topic of Ivan Light's paper in which he distinguishes succession from four other modes of ethnic rank change which arises in periods of labor scarcity—displacement, leapfrogging, situs enhancement, and situs deterioration.

Judith Nagata in "Defense of Ethnic Boundaries: The Changing Myths and Charters of Malay Identity" reviews competing "primordialist" and "circumstantialist" theories of ethnicity. In her opinion, adequate research should combine both approaches. Malay have considered their affiliation with Islam to be a primordial characteristic of their ethnic identity. However, in modern times, Malays distinguish themselves from other comparable ethnic groups even when some of these groups adhere to Islam. An ethnic Malay who does not adhere to Islam is still considered not to be a Malay.

G. Carter Bentley reports on the Sulu Case in the southern Philippines pointing to the ethnic segmentation in the economical and political stratification among the
Tausug, Samal, and Bajau living on the Sulu Archipelago. The Samal, who produce for subsistence and for the market, are clients of the Tausug nobility. They may aspire to Tausug identity while the Bajau, a boat-dwelling pariah group, suffers from restricted participation in most areas of social life. Political-economical dominance gave the Tausug the means to maintain the system of ethnic differences.

Mark A. Tessler, the political scientist, talks on "Ethnic Change and Non-assimilating Minority Status: Jews in Tunisia and Morocco and Arabs in Israel." He differentiates between four types of change when communal solidarity increases or decreases or where people start to identify with external or internal social systems. "Diasporication" is exemplified by urban Jews in Tunisia and Morocco. Nonurban Jews in Tunisia constitute the second type of "assimilation" where, during a time of diminished communal solidarity, they increasingly identify with the country's Arab Muslim majority. Urban Arabs in Israel, however, belong to the third type of "irredentism" where communal solidarity increases and they see themselves being a part of a broader Palestinian nation. The fourth type, "communalism," is experienced by nonurban Arabs in Israel whose communal solidarity increases, yet they also increasingly identify with the Israeli society.


The emergence of a new pan-Indian nationalist movement in the United States is analysed by Ronald L. Trosper. He observes Indians claim to share a common identity on the basis of having a common cause. The welfare dependency of Indians also stimulated these nationalist movements.

Richard W. Trottier, in "Charters of Panethnic Identity," also examines people from diverse backgrounds being mobilized into unified ethnic nationalist movements. When he, however, concludes that the Asian-American movement "remains merely an interest group" with the Asian-American identity being "no more than a matter of political expediency for a small segment of the total Asian-American population," something seems to be missing.

In the concluding essay, Abner Cohen discusses "Variables in Ethnicity." For him an ethnic group is "a collectivity of people who share some interests in common and who, in interaction with other collectivities, coordinate their activities in advancing and defending these interests by means of a communal organization," manipulating "in the process such cultural forms as kinship, religion, myths of origin, and ceremonial." He sees ethnicity vary in degree, depending on the magnitude of the group's interest and on the pressure imposed on its members by other groups. When the degree of pressure is constant, the type of organizational articulation may also vary. Where both degree and form of organization are constant, the cultural forms exploited by the group in the articulation of its organization will vary. Cohen delineates different stages in the history of the Creoles of Sierra Leone: negatively defined category (1787-1849), status group (1850-98), estranged collectivity (1899-1946), challenge and emergence of corporate consciousness (1947-57), development of communal organization (1957-67). In his detailed cross-cultural analysis he considers also the factor of a state elite, degrees of ethnicity, subjective factors, power (economic-political) factors, organizational factors, and the state system as a factor.

This volume is a valuable contribution to the theoretical literature on ethnic identity and change.
REFERENCE CITED:

Ruth-Inge Heinze
University of California, Berkeley


The Institute of Religious Iconography at the State University Groningen has embarked on an encyclopaedic survey. The institute does, however, not intend to cover the whole field of study and will neither be concerned with theoretical and comparative aspects nor detailed regional and thematic problems. The goal is to publish a yearbook on "Visible Religions" with supplements to iconography of religion appearing as occasional monographs.

The present publication is such a supplement. It has been prepared by H.I.R. Hinzler in cooperation with the author. "Drawings of Balinese Sorcery" is the last work of Professor C. Hooykaas who died in 1979.

Some of the fine-pen drawings have been collected by Professor V. E. Korn who bequeathed his books and other material to the Koninklijk Instituut voor de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde, Leiden. The largest portion of the drawings belongs to the Kirtya Liefrinck-Van der Tuuk (now Kirtya) Foundation, Singaraja on Bali. Hooykaas also used manuscripts at the Preussische Staatsbibliothek, Berlin (West Germany); the British Museum in London; Cornell University in the State of New York and the University Library in Sydney. He was assisted by his friend I Gusti Ngurah Ktut Sangka of Puri Gde, Krambitan (Tabanan).

Hooykaas does not want to analyse the close relationship between religion and magic. He concentrates on magic as "a universal human effort to procure safety, love, welfare, victory, etc., by enlisting supernatural forces against facts of nature and man," and he is guided by eight "directions" or considerations in compiling this book. (1) While the formal aspects of Balinese religion are becoming better known, the complementary magical aspects are neglected. (2) Magic has a visible and important place in every Balinese household. (3) The literary aspects of magic have been dealt with only partially and one-sidedly. (4) While research has been conducted on brahmins, exorcists, dalang (puppeteers), and other medical practitioners, the balian has been seen rather as a witch-doctor than a magician. (5) The black-and-white graphic art of Bali is not sufficiently known. (6) Marie Therese Berthier and John Thomas Sweeney's recent book Bali, l'art de la magie is charming but not exhaustive. Hooykaas wants (7) to stimulate researchers to work in other parts of Indonesia where they (8) through comparisons, can learn to distinguish better aboriginal from Hindu elements.

Bringing different collections of Balinese magic drawings together, Hooykaas sees himself as a historian. He finds that "real insight and understanding can come
only from those who are able to participate completely." Thus they will be able to describe their experiences. He mentions previous work on mudrās and the importance of holy water for exorcism (toya panglukatan) and for cleansing (toya pabresihan). Balinese have, indeed, until recently called their religion Agama Tirtha (Religion of Holy Water).

As inevitable followers of benevolent gods, evil spirits are evoked and given their share. The eka-dasa-rudra ritual, for example, aims at pacifying the supreme spirit of evil ruling over the eight directions. This ritual is performed only once each century. In the twentieth century it was performed in 1963 and repeated in 1978/79. During the ritual magic and religion are inseparable.

Hooykaas mentions the importance of knowing how to behave properly in everyday life, in front of household shrines, at cross-roads or during rites of passage (pregnancy, death).

The book is divided in three sections: I. Gods and Devils, Men and Means, II. Keeping Watch, Change and Defence; III. Counter-Attack, Killing the Enemy.

Among the numerous illustrations we recognize also universals—the serpent around a staff, the uruboros and the thunderbolt, to mention a few.

In his "Drawings of Balinese Sorcery," Hooykaas has done the groundwork in collecting basic material, sufficient to stimulate future researchers whether they want to analyse the elements of these drawings or whether they want to study the context in which these drawings are used.

NOTE:

Ruth-Inge Heinze
University of California, Berkeley


Stella Kramrisch wrote this book like an epic poem which has been retold over the centuries by various bards. For many years Kramrisch has surveyed the wide range of Sanskrit literature from the Vedas to the Purāṇas, looking for cues on Śiva.

Quoting from the scriptures, she shows Rudra, the proto-Śiva, as archer and healer. She talks about the primordial scene, the violence of the first creative act, the creation of Vāstūpati (the Lord of the Sacred Order), the homologies between Rudra and Agni and the theophanies where Rudra’s and Śiva’s names are used interchangeably. We learn about the "refusal to procreate and the encounters with death," the symbolic meaning of the linga, Śiva the Androgynous God, Bhairava, the Family of Śiva and the Demons (Rudra’s asura nature already being mentioned in Rg Veda 2.33.9 and 5.42.11).

Redundancies are unavoidable and we wonder whether contradictions are really paraphrases of the basic motifs. In the Rg Veda and the Maitrāyani Śaṁhitā, for
example, Rudra appears as hunter created by Prajāpati. In the Brāhmaṇas and the Atharva Veda, Rudra is the child of Prajāpati while in the Liṅga, Śiva, Kūrma and Bhāgavata Purāṇas, Rudra issues from the head of Brahmā, e.g., from Brahmā's breath. In the Skanda Purāṇa, however, Rudra issues from a drop of Brahmā's blood.

On p. 142, Rudra swallows the old heroic cosmos and Śukra then rises as the morningstar of Rudra's cosmos, while Vṛṣṇi, killed by Indra, remains dead at the bottom of the waters. The creation of Brahmā does not seem to be a revelation because he is not mentioned in the Vedas, his creation appears in the śruti literature where he descends from Śvayambhū, the Cosmic Egg or is lotusborn, born from the navel of Viṣṇu.

We learn about time conquered and forms of space. In the Atharva Veda time is the father of Prajāpati but in the Śvetāśvatara Upaniṣad Śiva is the maker of time.

The rhapsodic presentation of the many faces and the omnipresence of Śiva includes also legends around Sirius (the Dog Star), the iconography of the antelope and the reasons for building sacrificial altars to restore the wholeness of the universe. Discrepancies are explained with the appearance of Rudra and Śiva in different kalpas.

The book is a personal document not only because it is the result of intensive studies but because it contains the author's meditations on the topic. This becomes obvious especially in the last part of the book where Stella Kramrisch describes and interprets the Cave Temple at Elephanta in following her personal intuitions.

"The Presence of Śiva" certainly stimulates those who study Indian art and mythology, but one wonders whether the book is not difficult to read for those who are unfamiliar with the topic. The numerous quotations, the different statements about Śiva, the various legends demonstrate eloquently the many facets of the Śiva image. An unprepared reader may lose track of the different sources and how the different aspects developed. It is, however, also possible that a reader simply leans back and enjoys the book on its own grounds. The photos of Praful C. Patel contribute to its beauty.

Ruth-Inge Heinze
University of California, Berkeley


Brindavan is the spiritual center of North India. It is believed that Krishna was born in Mathura near Brindavan and then grew up among cowherders on the banks of the river Yamuna at Brindavan. Thousands of pilgrims come each year to Brindavan in the Braj region south of Delhi to watch the rās lilas. These religious dramas about Krishna are played and sung by young boys, with a few older actors participating mainly in comic parts. Both, actors and audience, experience the living presence of Krishna.

The rās lilas are based on a dramatic tradition which is at least five hundred years old. The original authors are, in most of the cases, forgotten. Retaining the traditional plot structure, the plays are constantly recomposed by the rādhārīs introducing new songs.
Hawley leads the reader into the setting of the plays. We find in the pilgrimage town of Brindavan widows being paid to continuously chant the Mahamantra at Bhajan Āśram. Daily temple worship also recapitulates Krishna’s diurnal schedule. The rās, however, focus on the legends around Krishna.

The author recorded the actual performances of four plays—“The Birth of Krishna,” “The Theft of the Flute,” “The Great Circle Dance,” and “The Coming of Akrūr” (who calls Krishna to the court of Kana in Mathura). These rās were produced by a single company during the summer of 1976. It was a single stage family who sometimes also recruits outside boys.

The translations are supplemented by stage directions, photographs and a discussion of their legendary and ritual contexts. Hawley shows how the religious and emotional worlds of the audience and the performers are related. In describing convincingly how the “divine presence” is experienced by the actors and the audience during the performance, Hawley succeeds in capturing the spirit of Brindavan.

This book is not only a valuable contribution to the study of legends around Krishna, to our knowledge about pilgrimage places and to the history of folk drama in northern India, it is a delight to read also for the non-initiate.

Ruth-Inge Heinze
University of California, Berkeley


This volume contains twenty-four contributions to a seminar on “The Stūpa, Its Symbolism, Its Religious, Historical and Architectural Relevance” which was held at the South Asia Institute of the University of Heidelberg, West Germany, from July 3 to July 7, 1978. The papers, of varying length and quality, are published in regional order. Constrained by space limits, it is impossible for the reviewer to go into any detail, however, I will attempt to convey at least some of the essential elements of each contribution.

In his introductory speech, Brijinder Nath Goswamy discusses the etymology of the word stūpa and investigates terminological equivalents from the Rg Veda, to caityas, relic holders, the eśāka in the Mahābhārata and the Tibetan chorten or dungs ten.

The most provocative contribution is made by John Irwin who talks about the axial symbolism of the early stūpa, its primary component being an axial pillar of wood around which a mound was built later on. Irwin shows the development of the yasti yūpa (“sacrificial post”) to a staff with umbrella on the summit. He analyses the function of the Indra kīla (“Indra’s peg”), stabilizing the universe at the time of the creation. He compares the liṅga with the symbolism around Indra, the fire, the sun, and the cosmic pillar and concludes that the axial pillar of the stūpa is pre-eminently a symbol of cosmic ascension, the Axis Mundi itself. Irwin is challenged by Dr. F. R. Allechin who, in an appendix, reminds Irwin that he cannot use the same analogy when he speaks of the Cross (Christianity) and the Bodhi tree (Buddhism), declaring both to be the symbolic representation of the Cosmic Tree.

Heinrich Gerhard Franz, in his contribution on the stūpa and the stūpa temple
in the Gandhāran region and Central Asia, tells us how the round stūpa was superseded by terraced and towered monuments, square stūpas and stūpas with niches in the second to fourth century A.D. under the Kuśāṇa Dynasty. He follows the development of stūpas and pagodas in early Buddhist cave temples in China, where, after the Northern Wei dynasty was transferred to the south (Lo-yang) in 494, new caves were also excavated at Lung-mên, the new capital. He finds that later caves belong to the T'ang Dynasty.

George Mitchell talks about the “Pilastered Walls on Indian stūpas and Temples.” Gritli von Mittwallner analyses “Two Stūpa Basements of Mathurā of the 4th and 5th century A.D.” in looking at the development of the dharmacakra mudrā in the Kuśāṇa and early Gupta period. She dates reliefs by the form of the lions’ whiskers being rolled in the shape of volutes. According to her, the lion pedestal was invented by Gupta artists.

Klaus Fischer investigates the “Hidden Symbolism in Stūpa Railing Reliefs: Coincidentia Oppositorum of Māra and Kāma” and points to the erotic meaning of ascetic sculptures and the ascetic content of erotic ones.

Gourizwar Bhattacharya speaks on the “Stūpa as Maitreya’s Emblem,” going on to examine the development of the dharmacakra mudrā in the Kusana and early Gupta period. She dates reliefs by the form of the lions’ whiskers being rolled in the shape of volutes. According to her, the lion pedestal was invented by Gupta artists.

Elisabeth Rosen sheds light on the relationships of lay patrons to the different Buddhist sects and the Buddhist architecture at Nāgārjunakoṭa.

In his paper on the “Stūpa Architecture of the Upper Indus Valley,” Jan Pieper presents some observations of the eight building types and the spatial significance of the Ladakhi mChod-ten which recollect the form of the original relic shrines of the Buddha, consisting of a throne, a stūpa, and an inverted dome.

Niels Gutschow, in another brief paper, discusses the urban context and the spatial development of the stūpa in Bhaktapur / Nepal.

We find Frank Raymond Allchin’s contribution on the “Asokan Stūpas of Pāṭāna,” Mary Shepherd Slusser on “Nepalese Caityas as Mirrors of Medieval Architecture,” and Ulrich Wiesner on the empty niche in Nepalese votive stūpas of the Licchavi period. Hermann Goetz and Pratapaditya Pal have already pointed out that the ground plan of the early Nepalese votive stūpa is closely related to that of the Gandhāra stūpa. There are, however, important differences.

Philip Denwood tells us how the Bonpos contributed to the building of stūpas in Tibet.

Gustav Roth carefully discusses the symbolism of the Buddhist stūpa according to the Tibetan version of the Caitya-vibhāga-vinayodbhāva-sūtra, the Sanskrit treatise Stūpa-lakṣaṇa-hārīkā-viveca, and a corresponding passage in Kuladatta’s Kriyāsamgraha. He also considers excerpts from the Pāli Mahāparinibbāna-sutta and other Vinaya versions.

Julian Sherrier compares the iconography of the Mahāparinirvāṇa in different texts. When searching for an answer to the question whether the stūpa was only a symbolic depiction of the parinirvāṇa, Joride Ebert uses the Javanese Sung hyang Kamadahāyani, the Lalitavistara, several Vinaya versions and the Saddharmapuṣṭakika, stressing that, in the seventh and eighth centuries A.D. the symbolic meaning of the stūpa was greatly connected with the “ultimate annihilation.”

Hans-Joachim Klimkeit continues in discussing the stūpa and the parinirvāṇa as Manichaean motifs.

Lothar Ledderose talks briefly about “Chinese Prototypes of the Pagoda,” using
a cosmological diagram and a central shaft. He observes the resiliency of old forms, e.g., the dew basins for immortals on top of a pagoda, even when the old "magic tower" later on has only the function of a gate tower.

Dietrich Seckel continues to survey stūpa elements surviving in East Asian pagodas. The brick, stone or wooden structures of China, Japan, Korea may differ in their tower-like superstructure, they, however, still preserve the spherical stūpa (anda) complete with harmikā and chatra mast on their tops.

Adalbert Geil uses the Dīvyāvadāna, Cakkavattisamudrakāna Sutta (Dīghanikāya) to explain the cosmical symbolism expressed by the spire of the Ceylonese dagoba. He also mentions the yūpa and the Indra kīla. He finds that the yūpa at Anurādhapura, for example, stood separate from the umbrella-shaft (yaṣṭi); it appears separate also on an Amarāvati relief. He concludes with saying that the yūpa represents Mt. Meru. Anurādhapura had the yūpa, Polonnaruva not. Polonnaruva developed the devatākotuvā ("Abode of Gods") with astādikpālas. These gods, each protector of one of the eight directions, replace the earlier caturmahārajaṅgas ("Rulers of the Four Directions" on Mt. Meru). Thus the devatākotuvā, being eight-panelled, represents the upper octagonal part of the yūpa as well as the top of Mt. Meru.

Hans Ruelius investigates the stūpa as mentioned in the Śilpaśāstras and then turns to the discussion of Sinhalese rituals.

Johanna Engelberta von Lohuizen-de Leeuw furnishes us with a well-documented survey of different stūpa forms in Indonesia. Starting with the most famous Barabudur on which other (pot-shaped and bell-shaped) stūpa forms are depicted, she discusses also the excavations at Candi Kalasan and Candi Plaosan, textual references in the Sang Huang Kamahāyānikan, the Nāgarakṛttagama and the linga stūpas, concluding that the symbolism inherent in these structures represents the doctrine and the universe and expresses "in a visible form the great mystery of spiritual enlightenment."

In the concluding essay, Lokesh Chandra offers a new interpretation of the Borobudur, the four divisions of the tantras (kriya, caryā, yoga, and annutara-yoga tantra) and their distinguishing characteristics, the thousand Buddhas, the etymology of the word Borobudur and its morphological elements and the correlations of its reliefs to the central deity Vairocana.

The above twenty-four essays demonstrate eloquently the complexity of the structural and symbolic elements of the stūpa. Many questions still remain unanswered. However, historians of religion as well as art historians should find ample stimulation for their own work in this volume. The editors have to be congratulated for making the publication of these studies accessible to a wider audience.

Ruth-Inge Heinze
University of California, Berkeley